

THE TOBA INDIANS OF THE ARGENTINE CHACO:
AN INTERPRETIVE REPORT

By
William D. Reyburn

Published by
Mennonite Board of Missions & Charities
1711 Prairie Street
Elkhart, Indiana

1st Printing 1954
2nd Printing 1959
3rd Printing 1970

Lithographed in U.S.A.

PREFACE

This brief report is an attempt to interpret some aspects of the life of the present-day Toba Indians who inhabit the central area of the Argentine Chaco. Interpret here must not be construed to mean an explanation of the meaning of a culture. It is rather an attempt to show how several aspects of Toba culture are related and the place these occupy in the process of giving meaning to the Toba. A purely descriptive or ethnographic account would be of only limited value since the persons to whom this report is addressed are daily describing Toba life. Those descriptions, however, are in need of integration which will give Toba culture an integral wholeness. The resulting integration is something of an abstract but greatly aids us in understanding the parts in terms of the whole. While the approach to this problem is essentially culturological it must not be thought that other approaches would not have considerable value in answering questions that arise from a sociological or anthropological study. The main distinction is that different approaches would suggest and answer questions of a somewhat different nature as well as adding information to the material presented here. The questions that arise from this particular method of study are very pertinent to Toba mission endeavor and that is what validates the present approach.

This report is based upon a short study of this group while the writer was in the process of collecting data and writing a grammar of the Toba language for the Mennonite missionaries at Nam Cum, Argentina. Since only four months were available for the combined linguistic and ethnographic investigations, the report lacks much in terms of a completed task. It was undertaken specifically to provide the missionaries with an anthropological orientation to their problems, and what is given here should be considered only as a point of departure for their continued activity.

I am especially grateful to Dr. E. A. Nida, Secretary for Translations of the American Bible Society, for suggesting this

work and for making it financially possible. I am indebted to my wife for the time she was able to spare from our infant daughter and from organizing Toba literacy work to assist me in collecting and analyzing the data. She also wrote the section on kinship terminology in Chapter III. I also wish to acknowledge my appreciation to John T. N. Litwiller, Mennonite missionary at Nam Cum, whose stimulating discussions always helped to throw much light on the problems discussed here. I wish also to thank the Mennonite Board of Missions and Charities, and especially Reverend Nelson Litwiller of Buenos Aires; also the Buckwalters, Litwillers and the Cressmans at Nam Cum for their kind hospitality and genuine co-operation in our language as well as anthropological undertakings. Finally, to the most interesting people I ever met, the Toba, I am grateful for the opportunity of having been among them. They have left a lasting impression engraved in my thoughts.

W. D. R., Rio Bamba, Ecuador
November, 1954

INTRODUCTION TO THE SECOND PRINTING

Five years have passed since this booklet was written. If I were to rewrite it, it would be somewhat changed. However, the conceptual framework would remain much as it is. The thesis remains just this, that man must get into contact with men in order to speak. The missionary task involves one in the most realistic of all communication situations. For the missionary the question "What is the living reality confronted by the Gospel in this man's way of life?" must abide in his mind as a way of thinking about his life and work.

Missionary problems are not unique. They are common to all men who seek to speak the Christian message. The difference between the problems of proclaiming the Gospel in Europe, Africa, or to a South American Indian tribe differ only in degree and in their detail. It is, however, in this detail that the missionary is confronted by the unfamiliar, the strange, the hidden.

The missionary is becoming an outmoded role in much of the world. This is as it should be. Present-day experience in Africa has made this particularly clear. The traditional "missionary" is or has been the teacher, the "massa," but the Christian church has and continues to grow. The missionary is to become a brother or to become extinct. The awakening of the non-European world through the church, education, modern transportation and communication brings the missionary into a world demanding a higher degree of sharing. Mission churches in many parts of the world are no longer dependent upon European leadership. Educational direction which was once the responsibility of missionaries is now often shared or is entirely in the hands of the people and the local government. The results of indigenous leadership do not always produce the same degree of efficiency and material output which European leaders have often (though by no means always) achieved. This means for many Europeans a disappointment in the people and indicates a feeling of superiority as is sometimes expressed in the words "I told you it wouldn't work; they just don't have it." European structures appear to fit well and to grow as long as Europeans are holding them up. When under local leadership they sag or tumble it is not so much a reflection on the inability of the people as it is on the premises upon which these structures were built. Fortunately in some areas church organizations and other institutions are formed gradually with the people and not in spite of the people. In this picture, breakdown and malfunctioning present the missionary with the choice of leaving the scene or of living and working under the local leadership as a Christian brother. It is precisely in the role of brother that he is called and it is imperative that he function in this role with a deep comprehension of the living reality about him.

A further fact which should be stressed is that the individual relationship between missionary and local folks is developing a new kind of situation. As long as the missionary was busy organizing churches, building schools, teaching groups of people at every occasion, the individual contacts were more in the form of relaxation. Also the local person had the tendency to feel that his own personal life was too far removed from the missionary's to share with him anything other than emergency situations where the missionary's influence or wealth could be utilized. The edu-

I. HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

Historical information on the Toba, like that of all our primitive contemporaries, has its beginning at a comparatively late date in the scheme of human knowledge. We are concerned here with the fragmentary accounts of a simple society whose existence quietly flowed far from the great floods of activity which have come to determine the course of Western history. While the hunting and gathering ancestors of the Toba were migrating about in the heart of central South America building fires, chipping flint, scraping skins, and trapping animals with crude snares, great civilizations had come into shape on the banks of the Nile. While the ancestors of the Toba concerned themselves about the practical affairs of getting a living and protecting themselves from marauding beasts and unfriendly neighbors, Babylon was advanced in poetry, sculpture and legal institutions. Plato's The Republic and Aristotle's Physics were written at a time when the forefathers of Cacique Martinez were as unaware of writing as they were unaware of the influence these philosophers were to have on the thinking of the world at large. Now it may be that Cacique Martinez' ancestors were also formidable men of thought, but if they were, their influence did not fall into the streams that inundated the major paths of the world, and therefore cannot be of any consequence in general history. As the cultures of Europe spread about, the shores of the Mediterranean grew closer and closer to the banks of the Bermejo and the Pilcomayo. While the Toba were experiencing their first contact with white men, Francis Bacon in England was sounding the key for future generations of intellectual thought. The great Spanish Armada was fastly dominating the seaways of the world, and a Saxon priest named Luther was becoming famously excommunicated. Only ten years later a small group of community-type nonconformists began migrating out of Switzerland, some of whom were many years later to be called North American Mennonites.

While the reformers were reforming and the counterreformers were counterreforming, the famous Catholic militia known as the Society of Jesus were greeting the Toba with la' and nal'en all

along the Pilcomayo river. Every means available was used by the Jesuits to conquer these heathen for the Faith. This spiritual conquest went hand in hand with the military penetration of the Chaco. The Jesuits often sought to convince the civil authorities that their spiritual subjugation was far more effective than military campaigns.

The importance of this area lay not in its potential wealth to the Spanish crown, but as a possible short cut from the Paraguay river to Peru.¹ The overwhelming difficulties presented by Chaco topography and vegetation, plus the numerous hostile Indian groups, made colonization almost prohibitive. The outposts of Tucuman and Santiago del Estero were founded, but these were manned largely by Indians (Tanacote, now extinct).

The warlike nature of these seminomadic Chaco tribes and their linguistic diversity greatly increased the difficulty of missionizing. The Jesuits found in the Chaco a complex of small tribes and numerous languages. There may have been as many as fifty tribes grouped into eight language families. Of the seven tribes making up the Guaicuruan language family, only the Toba, Pilaga and Mocovi exist today. The Tobas appear to have been divided into approximately ten divisions, each possessing its own name and general hunting territory. The Jesuit mission strategy formed a ring about the Chaco and in some manner or other affected the lives of practically all the Chaco tribes. While the vigorous Jesuit missionizing was only a partial success most of this progress ground abruptly to a halt when the Jesuits were expelled from South America in 1767. In the north missions were disbanded and in the south the less fervent (if not less capable) Franciscans took over the work among the Toba and Mataco.

The policy of these early missionaries was largely determined (as today) by the obvious situation they encountered as well as by

1 Historical data here is taken largely from the Handbook of South American Indians, Vol. I, Government Printing Office, Washington, D. C., 1946.

their own cultural backgrounds. The seminomadic Chaco tribes had to become sedentary if they were to quietly learn the formulae for gaining heaven and living on this earth as children of the one true God. A catechism class on the move through dense underbrush in search of satiating a hunger drive was quite incompatible with the learning traditions of medieval Europe. Since a priest could operate only in terms of a parish, parishes had to come into being. Tribes were induced to come into campos or reducciones where a rudimentary technical assistance program was undertaken. These aids were no different (except in degree of technology) from the so-called modern phase of Christian missions which we have today. The reduccion mission plan was aimed at teaching people to live together (although they had long ago learned not to do so if they valued survival) and to provide them with a means of feeding and clothing themselves. This meant the learning of certain manual skills such as weaving and carpentry. Agriculture and stock raising were introduced to supply food for the missionaries and Indians. Now this was a very logical plan for people who were raised in feudal Spain, but it failed to take into account the little man who would be king of us all, custom.

Communication being the kind of thing it is, it is difficult to say how much of their message the Jesuits and Franciscans ever registered on their converts. However, there are two overwhelming results that were accomplished. First, sickness and death reduced the entire area of the Chaco by at least 60 per cent of its precontact population. Angered by the horrible increase in mortality, the Indians fought back. Secondly, Spanish missionary culture had unwittingly placed within the grasp of these nomadic people a new and dangerous weapon, the horse. With increased mobility the Chaco bands began attacking the missions as well as old enemy tribes. The introduction of the horse at this time provided fluidity to an already established freewheeling society. The plentiful game supply of the Chaco found itself outwitted and outrun by these harmless grass-eating beasts that seemed bent on serving man's every desire. The roving extended family bands found themselves drifting at greater distances, crossing into hostile territories and fighting on the run. Outstanding horsemanship soon became a prerequisite for headmanship. In short,

the entire economic, social, and political structure of life found itself regrouping its elements to make room for this desirable new friend of the Toba, the horse.

Colonization of the Chaco did not keep abreast of the growth of large cities to the south. The 17th century in the Chaco was characterized by Spanish punitive raids against the unruly Chaco tribes. The few colonists that ventured to settle in the Chaco always located near army outposts. During the wars of independence the Chaco was temporarily forgotten, only to become a center for accelerated colonization in the late 19th century. The growth of the Argentine Republic and concern for national boundaries inspired Argentina to send its army north to the Pilcomayo. This was a systematic advance which made the country safe for colonization.

The economic base of the Argentine Chaco colonization was stock raising, mainly cattle and horses. The character of this economy inevitably led to serious conflicts with the Chaco tribes who were alerted to the dangers of the steady encroachment upon their hunting territories. Cattle by the thousands began to roam where Tobas were still attempting to hunt. It became quite pointless from the Toba hunter's point of view to spend all day chasing down a two-meal yasuncho when a fiesta-fat cow was to be had for the killing. The colonizers soon became aware of this situation and attempted to fence in their pasture lands. However, the Toba found a fence a small obstacle to overcome, and the conflicts between these two diverse economies continued to mount.

Following close on the heels of the cattle colonization was the establishment of obrajes for the exploitation of tanin from the quebracho colorado; also the development of sugar plantations induced many Toba workers to seek employment in new and strange environments. Thus the industrial phase of the Chaco contact brought numerous Tobas into mixed labor camps where abrupt cultural disintegration and readjustment were bound to follow.

While the horse provided the Toba a more effective means of satisfying his hunger, he soon learned that game was exceedingly

hard to find. He had been able to kill it faster than it could reproduce itself. As stated above the cattle economy of the colonos only served to heighten the conflicts between Indian and white. What then was to be the solution? The Indians expressed their feeling on this question as late as 1916 and again in 1924. Their reply to a deadlocked situation: armed rebellion. In several areas the Toba attacked the colonists and attempted to drive them out. The Tobas were forcefully put down by the Argentine Army. The will to seek a traditional way of life was now finally broken after 400 years of conflict under conquest. The road ahead led to criollo life and absorption into the expanding social and economic strata of the nation. This is a story as old as war itself.

This fleeting sketch will serve in a small way to relate what follows to a more integral investigation into contemporary Toba life. Without losing sight of the roots that run in many directions below the surface we wish now to look into the living plant and see how some of its parts fit together. What we seek to find is not merely a picture of the parts but an understanding of the relations that obtain among them.

II. ECONOMICS AND AGRICULTURE

A Toba community may be described as a semisedentary, small-scale agricultural settlement consisting of a number of extended families working individually and co-operatively, and recognizing themselves as a distinctive social and political entity. Although this definition of a Toba settlement appears to possess contradictory terms, it may be explained as follows. The Tobas constitute a socio-political group set off from their criollo neighbors. They are presently moving into an advanced stage of acculturation to criollo norms. While attempting cotton farming as part of the movement-to-criollo process, they are to a considerable degree artificially separated from many kinship bonds which are loosely maintained by constant roaming and visiting. The call of the land does not merit first priority. Where an extended family group has been able to maintain its geographical continuity, farming is largely a co-operative undertaking. Where the numerous influences tending toward social and cultural disintegration have been operative leaving isolated families within a settlement the plan of labor is essentially individualistic. A Toba settlement carries with it a geographic designation (although non-Tobas may also live in the same area) and most frequently recognizes one individual, referred to as cacique, as the political leader. While genetic characteristics are becoming less distinguishing, a common first language still serves to identify the Toba. Dress is of no value in distinguishing Tobas from criollos.

At various periods during the past 25 years certain Tobas or groups of Tobas have petitioned the national government to grant them the steadily shrinking land areas they were occupying. This was done as a result of the rapid encroachment of the white settlers which so completely upset the social and economic life of the Toba. The individual who took the initiative to appeal to the government was often said to have been "appointed" cacique. At any rate the Tobas have been more than willing to call the man cacique who has been instrumental in saving for them a place to call home where a last semblance of Toba social structure could

be held intact. Even after the settlement land was secured, the breakup of kinship bonds (due to roads, modern transportation, government reductions, cities, industry, etc.) and the pressing economic conditions (acquisition of a money-based value and prestige system) caused many Tobas to sell their land and drift onto land still held by relatives. The ownership of private property is still quite a foreign concept to most older Tobas and stands in sharp contrast to a culture that is geared to co-operative and communal pursuits. In those cases where an extended family band has been able to pull itself together, the co-operative concepts of Toba life have eased the transition from nomadic hunter to sedentary farmer. Even here, however, it has required the additional stimulus of desiring to conform to criollo life and accepting the new value system of money as an end in itself to complete the transition.

This economic readjustment to the land is not looked upon by the present-day Toba as an unhappy state of affairs when contrasted with the life of the past few generations. There is a strong tendency to ridicule the seminomadic hunting life of the antiguos and to speak with a mixture of disdain and shame of "our wild and unclothed grandparents." This process of adjustment which has been going on intensely for at least 50 years among the Toba has involved an acceptance of many new traits into Toba life. Among these we may cite the following: permanent house construction, a money economy, credit and loans, tailored clothing, tools and machinery, fenced-in farm plots, the Spanish language, some rudimentary education, prepared foods and drinks, tobacco, medicines and toilet articles, soccer, Spanish names, national laws and regulations, and finally now the franchise. Those accepted traits which have played the major role in reorienting Toba life have been economic ones. The role of religion and the church are being held for a later discussion.

Land in the Chaco is plentiful and the man who has the necessary attitude can make a success of cotton farming. The Tobas, however, are not primarily oriented to the land as agriculturists, in spite of their long contact with colonization. It is commonly heard among the Tobas that they have insufficient land and

not enough tools to undertake resettlement on uncleared fiscal land. This complaint only hides the more genuine causes for failure to express individualistic initiative. The government reducciones hold out to the Toba land in abundance and sufficient tools to farm it in a simple fashion, but the migration trends appear to be into the non-government-operated lands rather than into the reducciones. This problem of continued habitation of insufficient land under difficult economic conditions while living virtually in the shadow of plenty is true also in several other parts of Latin America. In the Toba case the reluctance to move onto government reducciones is generated by a social cohesion which tends to keep extended family groups intact regardless of severe economic difficulties. Such a family group will tend to cluster on a piece of ground held by one of the member units rather than divide and work alone. This should not be construed to mean that individual acts are not common. The point is rather that the entire history of the Toba has been one of economic activity built into the structure of the social communal unit, the extended family. Economic activity per se as a compartmentalized function in living has not completely penetrated through the underlying socio-economic values of the Toba. This socio-economic conflict will be discussed in Chapter III.

Missionaries the world over have found that it is much less difficult to plant the church where no organized religious system has prevailed than where a developed religious system has held sway. In a sense this situation holds for the introduction of agriculture to the Toba. As for agricultural methods, attitudes, and values the Toba began with a clean slate. They have merely attempted to copy their more successful criollo neighbors. There is yet no development of an agricultural "complex" such as is common among most farming people. This means that agricultural practices are not tied into any belief system outside of agriculture itself. There are practically no other-worldly sanctions to support any of the present-day subsistence activities. It naturally follows that a technical assistance program in agriculture could introduce unlimited innovations into Toba agriculture, and if these were done within the wider framework of Toba culture they would have considerable success. This is why it has never

been the agricultural complex in itself that has thwarted attempts to assist the Toba. The reasons are to be sought in the nonagricultural aspects of the Toba life setting.

The concomitant rise of towns in the Chaco and disintegration of Toba subsistence activities accelerated the Toba acceptance of a money economy. Unfortunately the Tobas never developed an agricultural base before they accepted a money economy. This point cannot be emphasized too strongly. It means that money found quick acceptance while an agricultural subsistence economy was practically spurned for many years previous. When game as a means of subsistence became extinct, colonizers brought with them country stores which provided them with staples. Here in the boliche the Tobas began to find that money was sufficient to secure the material necessities of life. The acquisition of money, then, became a prerequisite to the new subsistence.¹

Cotton raising dates to pre-European contact in the Chaco. Some Chaco Indians were weaving with locally grown cotton long before they received wool from the Spanish. However, today the Tobas have learned present cotton farming methods from their criollo neighbors and prize it as the only genuine source of cash income. Cotton is planted in late October and the first picking begins in early February and continues until mid-July, depending on climatic conditions. Cotton is usually weeded once by the Indian farmers. This serves to prevent the weeds being taller than the cotton for the final picking, a status which is satisfactory to the average Toba farmer. Where there is sufficient space it is common to plant a small quantity of sweet potatoes, corn, watermelon, squash, manioc and beans.

Most Toba farmers supplement their farm incomes by working as cosecheros for more prosperous criollo neighbors. The present Chaco cotton varieties are slow maturing types which

¹ Most Toba stories deal with the contact period (probably very late contacts) in which the Army plays a major role in introducing prepared foods to the Toba.

makes for an intermittent picking period of five to six months duration. From the point of view of efficient farming this may be considered a waste of time. (Most U.S. cottons mature over a three-month period.) However, from the point of view of a large number of Tobas this slow rate of maturation is exceedingly fortunate. It means that gross income is spread out over a greater period of time.

Among the Toba there are several hindrances to successful cotton farming. Most obvious of these is the lack of equipment, such as planters, plows, forges, etc. Also because of lack of fences Indian cotton plants are being constantly eaten by roving horses and cows. It appears that many Tobas possess more horses than they actually need. There still exists among the Toba, however, some horse prestige which was taken into the system many years before. This writer observed the animals of Cacique Petizo at League 15 break through a one-strand wire fence twelve times in a single day and eat what was calculated at 300 potential pounds of cotton. It took two adolescent children on horseback working all day to drive these animals from the cotton field and repair the broken fence.

Insects have added their destructive influence to cotton raising. Very few Tobas have undertaken spraying to combat the boll worms. At the present time there appears to be some economic help forthcoming from the government. This is mainly in the form of tools to increase production in line with present national economic policies.

The country store or boliche has become very important in the local economy of the Toba. Some bolicheros extend credit to the Indians, buy and market their cotton, sell to the Indians cotton seed, sacks and string for tying, and are the general purveyors of prepared foods. In short, the local boliche is tied in with many of the Indians' finances.

The use of wild products such as algarrobo pods, honey, etc. have become less and less important with the change to money. While most of the Indians retain a taste for wild honey, they do

not appear as anxious to obtain it as formerly. The disintegration of most tribal rites has also carried with it the loss of algarrobo pod chicha, the Toba beer. Mate is the universal beverage at this time.

Local crafts have also become minimal among the Toba. Some weaving and ceramics is found among the older females and a few of the older men make bows and arrows for sale in the cities. Hides are stretched and scraped and still serve as sleeping mats in some households.

The more successful farming families are able to secure bank loans in the cities. This helps tide them across the scarcity period following the cotton harvest. Others, at least in the League 15 area, regularly migrate into the outskirts of the city of Saenz Pena, 30 miles distant, to beg and sell such handicrafts as small bows and arrows.

In order to relate the above description to a specific case, an individual family economy will be laid out below. The family concerned is that of Francisco Rodriguez, age approximately 30; his wife Josefina, age approximately 25; and his three offspring, Ruben, age 7, Glicina, age 3 and Elida, age 1. This man was born in an isolated Toba area, El Espinillo, and moved to the mission at Nam Cum at approximately 15 years of age. He is characterized at the mission as a good worker, but subject to moody spells that make his co-operation with the missionaries rather spasmodic in character. At the time of his entrance into the mission the family consisted of the father and mother, three sons and three daughters, two of whom are now deceased. Today each of the sons has married and brought his wife into the mission. This extended family at the time of investigation contained eight regular adults and eleven children. Hence, this nuclear Rodriguez family extended from the original eight to nineteen individuals in approximately ten years' time. (This does not include members now deceased. If no deaths had occurred the total members would now be approximately 30.) This extended family is engaged in essentially the same economic pursuits.

The following chart shows Francisco Rodriguez' income in pesos for the year 1953.

Activity-Income Chart

<u>Month</u>	<u>Activity</u>	<u>Income</u> ²
January	Weeded own field	0.00
February	Worked on <u>criollo's</u> field	130.40
	" " " "	194.40
	" " " "	140.00
March	Picked and sold own cotton	1014.00
	Picked <u>criollo's</u> cotton	144.80
April	Picked and sold own cotton	896.20
	Picked <u>criollo's</u> cotton	406.10
May	" " "	389.40
June	" " "	148.80
July	" " "	60.00
August	" " "	50.00
	Did odd jobs for mission	86.00
September	" " " " "	160.00
October	" " " " "	128.00
	Plowed and planted own field	0.00
November	Cleaned <u>criollo's</u> field	120.00
December	" " "	258.00
	Total	4326.10

In the above Activity-Income Chart it will be necessary to point out that in March and April he sold cotton picked from his own land. All income from February through June was realized by picking cotton on his own or on a criollo neighbor's farm. Practically all income received from working on a neighbor's farm was paid in goods usually in the form of prepared food stuffs.

² At the time of this study, April-July 1954, the peso was worth approximately 7 cents on the official exchange rate and 4 cents on the free exchange.

All of this individual's income except for his odd jobs for the mission and his work in the months of November and December was earned while working in co-operation with his wife and children as well as with his extended family group.

Expenditures for this family included the following for the same year:

Food	3139.00
Clothing	800.00
Other	<u>453.00</u>
Total	4392.00

In order to check this figure representing food expenditure against that of other Indians, a sample was taken which showed the average Indian total food expenses to be approximately the same as the one given here. As a cross cultural comparison, checks were run on neighboring criollo families and on four North American missionary families who attempted to calculate a yearly food budget consisting of the following Toba and criollo diet.

Food Cost Chart

<u>Food</u>	<u>Cost</u>
flour	1.05 per kilo
grease	2.25 " "
noodles	2.25 " "
rice	3.30 " "
onions	1.20 " "
potatoes	1.00 " "
sugar	2.95 " "
<u>mate</u> tea	5.90 " "
salt	1.00 " "
powdered milk	14.00 " "
bread	1.50 " "
fresh meat	3.50 " "
prepared meats	10.00 " "
corn meal	1.00 " "

condensed milk	2.80 per can
soap	.80 " bar

Several Tobas were asked to figure independently their total food requirements on the basis of the above current prices. Below are given the criollo, missionary and Toba calculated food requirements for one year.

<u>criollo</u>	3,953
missionary	3,969
Toba	3,898

Although the sampling was small in all three classes, the overwhelming impression obtained is that the Tobas in these cases know what the cost of living requires in food expenditures. Looking back to what Francisco Rodriguez actually spent on food we find that he is 759 pesos below the calculated average. In other words, he is subsisting approximately 20 per cent below what Indians, criollos and missionaries calculate to be a "necessary diet."³

It will also be noticed in the Activity-Income Chart that the yearly income stems from three sources. This may be stated in percentages as follows:

Income from working own land	43 per cent
Income from working neighbor's land	42 per cent
Income from working for mission	15 per cent

An analysis of monthly income shows further that money received is very unevenly distributed throughout the year. Money received from January through June constitutes 80 per cent of the

3 This "necessary diet" consists of those things which the Indians and criollos purchase at the boliche. For the Indians some locally grown vegetables may be added. For the criollos more of a variety is available, including milk. For the missionaries this diet is a starchy gastronomical absurdity.

total cash received. This means that 20 per cent of the total income dribbles in over the remaining six months from July through December. It is apparent from the Activity-Income Chart that this disparity is due to the fact that the cotton picking season provides the bulk of the cash income. When the picking season ends there is an abrupt fall in income and six months of extreme scarcity.

Now this is no different from the criollo income pattern nor that of most single crop farmers in the world and should be no cause for alarm among the Toba. A wise spending schedule, carefully budgeted, carries the criollo over the nonharvesting season, so why shouldn't it do likewise for the Toba? The answer lies chiefly in the fact that the Toba operates very much within a Toba socio-psychological framework which has not become criollized. This means that the Toba pattern of life and the criollo-structured setting are each preparing to react to a similar situation in contrasting ways. The question that is being answered is: What's to be done with this cash? The Tobas are anxiously looking down the criollo way where they desire to be accepted as equals. This means, for one thing, maintaining an acceptable criollo appearance for the entire family. A disproportionate amount of Toba money goes for clothes which are soon tattered and worn out by living in a Toba environment. Also enjoying the amenities of this new and desirable way of life (seeking white identification) is exceedingly rewarding and must be indulged in while the money is at hand. The Toba stands with one foot in criollo land and one in Toba land. When the money is spent he can still enjoy the warm embracing society of his extended family in true Toba fashion.

There is a further reason for the Tobas' inability to save money. Beyond prestige and upward mobility there still exists within Toba social structure a sharing complex that tends to level all men and helps maintain a classless society. This attitude is supported within the child socialization process and finds its continued expression in almost every phase of Toba life. It merely means that what is available is potentially the property of many. Sharing finds its strongest expression within

the primary social units, but frequently passes these boundaries. To an observer with ideas of narrowly defined property rights and individualism, Toba sharing appears as a trait possibly inherited from Chaco vultures. It is not uncommon for an entire patch of squash or sweet potatoes to be eaten up by "visitors" in one evening. Many Tobas look upon this practice as very unwholesome and attempt to protect themselves by avoiding relatives and friends at certain times. The increase of this defense attitude rises with the mounting motivations towards personal wealth and incipient individualism, and creates many interpersonal tensions and conflicts.

The acquisition of material goods serves to strengthen the Toba's conviction that he should be accorded criollo status. Indians living on mission property have been particularly rewarded in this sense since they have had intimate contact with a vastly more materialistic culture than criollo life could offer. With the aid of the mission store, farm, used clothing sales, and missionary encouragement to build more permanent homes, eat at tables, and practice preventive medicine, the material impedimenta of these Indians has greatly outdistanced most of their nonmission relatives. Below is recorded a complete inventory of the house of Francisco Rodriguez who lives on the mission property.

Household Inventory

<u>Quantity</u>	<u>Article</u>	<u>Cost</u>
(kitchen)		
1	frying pan	7.00
1	metal pot	42.00
1	metal teapot	12.00
6	metal plates	5.00
1	large metal plate	4.00
1	saucepan	18.00
7	metal cups	15.00
1	enamel cup	3.00
7	spoons	21.00

1	wooden ladle	1.50
3	saucers	9.00
1	dipper	3.25
1	clay jar	5.00
2	metal tubs	50.00
1	iron container	35.00
1	<u>mate</u> straw	7.00
1	iron pot	78.00
(clothing)		
(husband)		
1	hat	33.00
3	dress trousers	190.00
1	work trousers	39.00
3	shirts	116.00
3	undershirts	27.00
1	sweater	50.00
2 pr.	canvas-fiber shoes	13.00
1 pr.	socks	7.00
1	suit coat	66.50
1	poncho	69.00
(wife)		
3	materials for dresses	123.00
2	materials for shirts	24.00
1	head scarf	8.00
1 pr.	canvas-fiber shoes	6.50
1	poncho	58.00
2 pr.	cotton trousers	60.00
(children)		
3	trousers	87.00
2	shirts	36.00
2	undershirts	12.00
1 pr.	canvas-fiber shoes	6.50
(household)		
4	blankets	100.00
2	mosquito nets	104.00
2	wooden beds	35.00
2	storage boxes	20.00
8	sack materials	25.00

(farm equipment)		
1	cultivator	300.00
1	saddle, complete	194.00
1	hammer	14.60
1 pr.	pinchers	30.00
1	wrench	32.00
1 pr.	ox chains	36.00
1	shovel	55.00
(livestock)		
1	cow	300.00
1	calf	100.00
1	horse	400.00
	1/3 interest in pair of oxen	<u>850.00</u>
Total inventory at cost value in pesos		3942.85

This individual's inventory of material goods shows that his stock and farm equipment constitute 60 per cent of the peso value of his total inventory.

Clothing and Household	1631.25	40 per cent
Farm Equipment	661.60	
Livestock	1650.00	60 per cent

Clothing and household goods are divided as follows:

Kitchen	315.75	19 per cent
General household	284.00	18 per cent
Husband's clothing	610.50	37 per cent
Wife's clothing	279.50	17 per cent
Children's clothing	141.50	09 per cent

It is particularly relevant to this entire problem that this individual's clothing constitutes 37 per cent of the total household inventory. This is not generally true of Indian fathers living independently of the mission. Here, as will be pointed out later, there is an intensive drive for the male Indians who preach to attain to the missionary dress standards. While 37 per cent of his household inventory consists of his own clothing, this amount is less than the value of one suit of the missionary.

The total cost inventory of Francisco Rodriguez is 3942.85 pesos or U.S. \$276.00. Allowing 30 per cent depreciation on clothing and household goods, this part of the inventory stands at 2760 pesos or U.S. \$193.00.

III. SOCIAL ORGANIZATION

The purpose of this chapter is to turn our attention from economic activity as such and to inspect the kind of societal structure and group behavior that gives life its togetherness among the Toba. It must be pointed out here that this subject could not be fairly dealt with apart from a consideration of the Toba church. However, it will be convenient to hold the discussion of the church for a later chapter.

As has been suggested in the preceding section, the Toba constitute a classless society. This means that economic and social diversity are not great enough within the Toba to place groups of individuals at different levels. It was also remarked that it is in part a socio-economic sharing complex which largely contributes to this status. While this holds true for the vast majority of Tobas, it is also true that there are a few exceptional families that are becoming conspicuously good Toba farmers and as such are beginning to form a nouveau riche class. Such a case is the Carmelo family at League 15. They tend to look down on their relatives who migrate each postharvest season to Saenz Pena to "share with the city whites."

It has also been pointed out that the Toba are exclusively a rural farming people who inhabit small islands of land within an ever encroaching sea of criollo whites. Concerning the non-Toba environment it may be said that these tiny islands are in a large part looking to the outside world and are attempting to imitate its norms. Each of these small Toba settlement islands is composed of clusters of people who, for the most part, recognize some kind of kin relationship. However, it is only the primary relationship that is really binding. A typical primary kin group would be a mother and father with their offspring and their offspring's spouses with their offspring. This is the typical extended family group. Usually it is a three generation group, but sometimes may consist of four generations. Extended families tend to cluster in extended family dwelling units called ranchos, but often they may be dispersed due to loss of land or other

factors. Marriage tends to unite young people within the same settlement island, but there is no social regulation determining the settlement from which a man chooses his wife, and he may travel a great distance for one. Neither is there a hard and fast rule of residence for the newly married. There is a tendency for girls to remain near their mothers, but other considerations may often override.

Typical settlement islands such as League 15, League 17, El Espinillo, Pozo la China are of less than a thousand population each. This means that the inhabitants reside together in a face-to-face association. That is, most all the adult members see and are seen, speak and are spoken to, at fairly regular intervals. In spite of the fact that the Tobas are partially oriented to the land, there continues to be an attitude of freedom to move upon the slightest provocation. Hence, a settlement community always has a fair number of migratory inhabitants. Some of the older people are completely migratory and spend most of their time drifting from relative to relative within the same settlement as well as traveling great distances to other settlements. This intracommunity, and especially intercommunity, movement serves to relate most of the settlements in a manner like modern transportation and communication serves to relate cities with each other. Some of these interconnected Toba communities are over a hundred miles apart.

In a Toba settlement birth is unaccompanied by any kind of ceremonialism. In earlier times a list of names was recited in the presence of a cantador or shaman who selected the appropriate name for the child. These names were often related to some local current event. Later in life the child received other names likewise connected with some outstanding event in which he participated. In some areas today naming is postponed for approximately a year. Nonconverts usually give a common Spanish name while converts do the same or seek a special Biblical name. One man was surprised to find that he had named his son by a name which represented an enemy of God's people, Filisteo (Philistine). There is still a taboo associated with the pronouncing of names of small infants and the dead. The taboo on naming the infant was

--at least in earlier times--to protect the infant from malevolent supernatural powers that lurk about. The meaning of the taboo seems to be lost now, but the delayed naming tradition appears to continue in many cases.

The Toba infant is not swaddled and may, according to the heat of the season, be quite free in its movements. It is usually placed in a cloth hammock inside the house. A rope is attached to the hammock and gently pulled back and forth by some household member sitting outside. When not in the hammock the infant spends most of its waking hours lying between the mother's crossed legs as she sits on the ground mending clothes or cooking.

As soon as the child is able to walk it begins to find a very compatible niche for itself among its many siblings, if it is fortunate enough to live within the extended family group. It is taught at a very tender age to cover its excreta, an excellent sanitary practice that seems to be practiced by all the Tobas. Parents are extremely indulgent with their children, a practice which strikes most missionaries as lack of discipline. A Toba child learns to be a Toba within a very nonauthoritarian atmosphere. There are few directions in which he finds his behavior seriously curbed. He is punished overtly for three major wrongs. These are:

1. Aggression toward older or younger siblings,
2. Failure to share with older or younger siblings, and
3. Failure to act upon self-made commitments.

The first may appear in contradiction to the statement concerning a nonauthoritarian framework. It is authoritarian in the sense of a group will, but not in the idea of a single individual exerting authority. This nonaggressive attitude means that the learning child is punished for attempting to enforce his will on his older or younger brothers or sisters. It means that the ego of the child must seek to identify itself with the group will rather than assert its own centrality. The implications resulting from such a learning process are multifold. It means that those individual desires which are prone to be expressed soon find themselves seeking an orientation to group wishes rather than seeking

for acceptance by the group. If one observes the children of an extended family in their daily play routine, he will soon note an almost total lack of disharmonious interaction such as striking, biting, kicking, teasing, pulling hair, pinching, pushing, tricking, or insulting. If these characteristics are seen, it will usually involve nonsiblings, and even here it is extremely rare. Sexual aggression is likewise strongly curbed at the intersibling level. However, as in the nonsexual behavior, there is a general relaxation of control when interaction passes outside the brother-sister-cousin relationship. At the level of individual behavior there is a general freedom to do as one pleases from an early age. Toba socialization tends to grant the individual a very wide berth as long as his actions are entirely personal and do not directly affect other people.

Related to the suppression of aggression between siblings is the overt encouragement of sharing of material goods. Stinginess in the sense of failing to share with others, regardless of how much one may feel his need of satiating a personal desire, is regarded by the Toba as serious wrong. The disintegration which Toba culture is experiencing, due largely to a new property value, is tending to set up conflicting attitudes towards sharing and co-operation. The incipient rise of individualism into the Toba value system is beginning to shine through in certain forms in present Toba life. In the Paraguayan Chaco, among the isolated Lengua and Chulupi, one sees very clearly a similar child socialization process which has undergone less change than among the Toba.

Finally, Toba values tend to place a responsibility on the individual for his personal acts if these directly affect other people. These are acts of personal commitment which must be completed in good faith. There is seldom any insistence that X perform a certain act, but if he makes it known that he intends to perform the act, he is responsible to the group will to realize that act or relieve himself of the responsibility by acknowledging his inability, change of mind, etc. Until X performs he is held in a state of suspended anticipation by his fellow Tobas. Too many failures to perform discredit a Toba in the eyes of other Tobas.

Punishment appears to be used more than reward in securing approved behavior. Oddly enough the major punishment in Toba child discipline, which is the withholding of affection, passes unnoticed to most missionaries who are busily stimulating the posterior anatomy of their unruly offspring with an algarrobo switch. It must not be thought that Toba parents are sparing the rod. The rod is merely defined differently within a culturally different world. I hasten to add that Toba missionaries should not attempt to copy such Toba ways as this. It would be like trying to shoot .22 shells in an atomic cannon. The point is that pieces fit and are functional only when they are geared to a whole complex, not as isolated parts.

It is understood, of course, that a Toba child is taught more than these few principles discussed here. What we have mentioned concerns the nature of attitudes which tend to affect many areas of life and determine the kind of mental posture which each Toba assumes as he goes through life. No one who has lived among the Toba has failed to be impressed with the almost total absence of personal conflicts that break open above the surface. I do not mean to imply that this smoothly oiled machine has no rust and weak spots. The rough spots are showing through in several ways. This will be discussed in Chapter V.

Since schooling is still largely nonexistent among the Toba and since manual crafts have fallen into disuse with cultural disintegration, there is little transmission of skills passed on to children. Children work alongside their parents as soon as they are old enough to help in the cotton fields. This means that children are free to play for approximately half of the year while the parents are idle, begging, or finding odd jobs.

The structure of family life is such that children are not excluded from any activity of the family. Drinking mate may be one exception. Children usually do not share mate with the older folks until the former begin doing a full day's work.

Young folks are quite free to carry on courtship, but this is done mostly in secret. Young Toba men express a desire to

court the criollo girls because "they let you know if they like you but the Toba girls are just shy." There is a desire on the part of the Toba males to marry into criollo families, but so far most Toba-criollo marriages have involved criollo men and Toba women. Polygyny is extremely rare as a form of marriage but it is rather common for a man to have a partner in more than one settlement. Relations between spouses are extraordinarily smooth.

Authority in the family takes the form we would expect from the information given in the preceding paragraphs. The father, who generally makes family decisions, does not do so without feeling about for the general consensus of opinion. Likewise, decisions affecting the entire extended family group are usually done in a very democratic manner with all adult members stating their opinion before a decision is arrived at.

Anything resembling castes or classes is conspicuously missing from Toba society. As has been said, the swingover to criollo ideals has begun to form something of economic classes, but this is very minor as yet. Social mobility exists not within Toba society but from Toba to criollo society. It is not clear at this time whether the church leaders may constitute a stratified class. It is very improbable, since this function is quite fluid and may be shared by almost any male believer. In such areas as Pampa del Indio the employment of certain Tobas as police, secretaries, etc., creates an occupational class apart from cotton farmers. These individuals, however, remain on their land and have their cotton farms in addition to public employment.

For the most part, Toba social organization maintains in force its kinship terminology. The following brief section is included to assist the missionaries in acquiring a grasp of the general picture of Toba kinship and a facility in using the proper kinship terms. A knowledge of these terms and how to use them will serve to create rapport between missionary and Toba. Terms were obtained from the Rodriguez family living at the mission at Nam Cum. However, as a general rule members of the Napo-riche-Cabrera family maintain that they use only the Spanish

terms. This would indicate a more rapid assimilation of Spanish language and breakdown of Toba social structure in such areas as League 17, than is occurring in such out-of-the-way places as El Espinillo, which is the original home of the Rodriguez family.

Eliciting kinship terms is highly complicated, due to the aforementioned Toba taboo on naming the dead. It was with great reluctance, and a degree of hushed reverence, that Avelina Rodriguez talked of a few of her dead relatives.

In listing the Toba kinship terminology, the following abbreviations are used:

mo - mother
fa - father
so - son
da - daughter
br - brother
si - sister
hu - husband
wi - wife

These are compounded in several ways. For example, mo mo is mother's mother or grandmother, wi br is wife's brother or brother-in-law, br da so is brother's daughter's son or grand-nephew, $\begin{matrix} si & da \\ br & so \end{matrix}$ da may be read as sister's daughter's daughter, sister's son's daughter, brother's daughter's daughter, or brother's son's daughter, in each case grandniece.

As has been indicated, the listing is not complete. However, the incompleteness lies chiefly in the area of the number of relatives denoted by a particular term, rather than in the area of the number of terms used. In instances in which a term might apply to a larger area of persons than actually indicated, these persons are noted and marked by a question mark.

For convenience sake, the nomenclature will be given in two groups, consanguineal terms and affinal terms. The former denote relatives by blood, the latter denote relatives by marriage. The Toba terminology is given in the left-hand column, the

persons whom it denotes are given in the right-hand column. In some cases, two forms were elicited. The second set was described by the informant as "está es la palabra suave y linda, que se usa en la casa." The difference probably corresponds to terms of reference and terms of address. The former are indicated first, the latter second. It will be noted that this dichotomy is not recorded for all the terms.

Consanguineal terms

<u>Reference</u>	<u>Address</u>	<u>Class of Relatives Denoted</u>
chera		mo
taq'ade		fa
yale ¹	yalole	da
yalec	yalolec	so
come	comole	mo mo, fa mo, mo fa si, mo fa mo si fa
yape	yape'olec	mo fa, fa fa, mo fa br, mo fa mo br fa
jiual	jiualole jiualolec	so so, da so, so da, da da, si da da, si da so br so br so
yacaya	yacayole yacayolec	br, si, fa br da, fa br so mo si mo si
yasoro	soro'ole ²	fa si, mo si
tesqua'alec		fa br, mo br
yasoshe	yo'ole	br da, si da
yasoshec	yo'olec	br so, si so

1 ya- 1st. sg. poss. pronoun is not separated from the stems which take this form.

2 Terms of reference are the ones most frequently given first in eliciting; however, this term is more frequently used than yasoro.

Affinal terms

jiua	sho	hu	
loua	jua	wi	
yasoro	soro'ole	fa br wi, mo br wi	
tesqua'alec		fa si hu, mo si hu	
yasoshe	yo'ole	wi br da	
		hu si	
yasoshec	yo'olec	wi br so	
		hu si	
ya'te	ya'te'ole	so wi, si so wi	
		br	
yadonxanec	yadonxanicolec	da hu, si da hu	
		br	
yacho	yacho'olec	wi fa, hu fa	
		hu mo br	wi mo br
		fa	fa
yachoro	yachorole	wi mo, hu mo	
		hu mo si	wi mo si
		fa	fa
jiuite		br wi	
jidaua	jidauale	hu si, hu br, wi si, wi br	
	jidaualec		
yale'i	yale'olec	si hu	
yadonxaua		hu si hu, wi br wi	

There are also special terms that are used for older brother, younger brother, older sister, younger sister, but these were not recorded sufficiently well to list here.

The terms listed above may be shown graphically by use of a family chart. The chart is given so that one may see at a glance a representation of the members of an extended family and their relationship to each other. The chart is constructed with the following symbolization:

◇ deceased

▲ male person

● female person

== marriage relationship

⌊ parent-child relationship

┌ sibling relationship

Nos. 8 and 9 are husband and wife, nos. 1, 2 are the parents of no. 8, no. 7 is her sister, nos. 5, 6 her brother and sister-in-law, nos. 13-15, 26 her nephews and nieces, nos. 16, 18, 20, 22-24 her children, nos. 17, 19, 21, 25 her children-in-law, nos. 28-36 her grandchildren, nos. 3, 4 her parents-in-law, no. 10 her brother-in-law.

The chart is not a complete listing of the members of this family, chiefly due to the aforementioned reluctance of the informant to mention the names of the dead.

No. 8 is printed in boldface type. The terms printed in boldface are the terms used by no. 8 in formally addressing that person, and so for each of the names and terms printed in italics and all caps.

Attention may be drawn to several conclusions from the foregoing listing. Perhaps the first thing to be noted is the difference between terms of reference and terms of address. The latter, of course, are more familiar terms. Some terms are exclusively male, some exclusively female, and some applied to either a male or a female. (However, in terms of address the addition of -ole or -ole-c to these last make the distinction between male and female.) Examples: chera, mother; taq'ade, father; yacaya, brother or sister; jual, grandchild but jualole, jualolec.

Nieces and nephews of the second descending generation (grandnieces and grandnephews) are called by the same terms as grandchildren, i.e. no. 8 calls no. 27 jual as well as nos. 28-36. Likewise in the second ascending generation (greataunts and greatgrandmothers) relatives are classified together, i.e. no. 33 calls no 8 and no. 7 by the same term. Siblings and cousins are also called by the same term.

Finally, it should be noted that where two families have many members intermarried (as is often the case among the Toba) the consanguineal term overrides the affinal term. For example, no. 9 refers to no. 19 as yaso^{she} instead of ya'te because she is to him primarily the daughter of his aunt rather than the wife of his son.

IV. POLITICAL CONTROL

Early Catholic missionaries, like missionaries today, found one individual in the tribe that was always upsetting well-laid plans. This man was the cacique. In early times the institution of cacique appears to have been hereditary, but the prime requisite for such a person was a strong and somewhat dominating personality. Since Toba culture tends to produce a limited number of such individuals (in a sense they are the abnormal), a strong cacique had little trouble maintaining his leadership position. After the coming of the horse, outstanding horsemanship was added to the desiderata of an acceptable cacique.

Caciques seldom sought to impose their will upon the group. Rather, they kept an ear to the ground for group opinions and finally came forth with their plan of action. Usually each independent composite band of extended families was under the direction of a cacique. The main function of the cacique was to lead the group in forays against enemies, direct the movement of the camp, organize for protection against attacks, and head up hunting parties. One of the main functions of the cacique was to act as a buffer between his people and neighboring tribes. When peaceful settlements could be arranged, this individual was responsible.

The present general psycho-sociological orientation of Toba life may be seen in this brief description of the cacique institution, i.e. the manner of expressing authority. Also, the group sharing complex extended to cover the goods of the cacique as well. Historical sources indicate that caciques were often the poorest in the tribe because they could refuse no one, and consequently, their accumulations of material goods were constantly being leveled by members of the tribe.

It is interesting to note that cultural disintegration among the Toba has removed nearly every trace of ceremonialism, broken up the basic economy, and made serious inroads into the social structure, but the institution of cacique has remained very much

intact. This means that this institution has continued to serve a definite need in Toba life. As these composite bands of kin groups lost out to a changing economy and experienced the re-orientation to the criollo way, there were numerous difficulties in accomplishing the transition.

The relentless sea of criollos was quickly engulfing the tiny Toba islands. The differences in life outlooks of the two peoples was obvious to both. While the Tobas desired to achieve acceptance by the criollos, Toba family and social organization was producing Toba, not criollo, personalities. The nonagricultural economic base of the Toba, surrounded by the rapidly rising agricultural criollos, faced the Toba with a single alternative: turn to the land and live from it.

This was a possible solution, but there was no security in earning a living from a land that was steadily slipping into criollo hands. The Toba bands faced a severe transitional crisis. The traditional cacique with his lack of Spanish and ignorance of white ways found himself incapable of filling the gap. His mind preferred to turn to happier and freer days when cattle could be stolen with impunity, when no land inspectors were making their rounds, and when the only roads crossing the dense Chaco were the ones that only the Indians knew. The result was the rise of a modern cacique. From out of the various tribal groups came men of a new generation speaking a halting Spanish and with the courage to face the white man's government cacique in the big city. These Toba envoys returned triumphantly, if ever so poor, to announce that the land they were on officially belonged to the Toba. Whether these men were officially blessed with caciqueship by government officials on these jaunts to the capital, or whether it was merely self-appropriated, appears to have been of little importance to the Toba back home. A sense of security in crises had been achieved and it was primarily to this new generation of caciques that the credit must go.

The new caciques soon found themselves entangled in the white man's red tape and began to lead their people into the valiant battle of bureaucracy. An atmosphere of legality saturated

with credentials, seals, signatures and stamps became the order of the day for the Toba. A new kind of recognition began to take hold. The dawn of national acceptance was ushered in by President Peron's generous gift of the franchise.

The rise of the modern cacique and the securing of Toba land rights took place concomitantly with the spread of Protestant Christianity and may be dated from approximately 1935. The new cacique found himself serving as a buffer in much the same way as his predecessor. This time, however, he was caught between a disorganizing Toba society on the one hand and a battery of local, state, and national officials on the other. The Toba were given little or no help in replanning their shifting economy. They had little farming tradition to build upon. Fences and equipment were costly and difficult to obtain. The idea of working six months on the ground before realizing any food was to the Toba a terribly inefficient way to live.

The criollos' prosperous farms held out a way of getting a living that was much more in accord with the whole bent of Toba life. Fences were cut and cattle killed in the fields. Stealing by the Toba had long been a constant source of concern and bitter feeling between criollo and Toba. It is only natural, therefore, that the law sought out the cacique and put legal pressure on him to make his people conform to national laws. The cacique found himself in a tragic and hopeless position. He was faced with the responsibility of attempting to buck against the stream of Toba tradition and become something of a law enforcing officer. As has been pointed out, authority among the Toba does not appear in the form of commanding, coercing or imposing a personal will. The cacique found this road too hard to take. About this time, however, there was an activity stirring in the towns along the Parana river which was to spread like fire among the Toba and consume much of the Toba's outward maladjustment to criollo life. This was the gospel dressed in its gayest color variety of Pentecostalism. The preaching of the Gospel and the establishing of the church brought the Tobas into a new awareness of their difficult socio-economic position and went a long way to provide a new base for adjustment to criollo life. The

impact of the ethical content of the Gospel among the Toba is discussed further in Chapter VI, which deals with the Toba church.

All of the Toba settlements of the central Chaco today have a cacique. However, the new generation cacique finds himself faced with new problems each day. The rapid incorporation into the national life and the recent government show of concern for the Indians' agricultural productivity has greatly increased the duties of this office. The present-day Tobas exhibit a very strong dependency attitude arising from the combination of Toba socio-economic structure and modern reorientation within the local, state, and national ways of life. Schools, roads, fences, tools and machinery are much in demand by the Toba, and local Toba committees are constantly journeying to the provincial capital or to the federal government to solicit these and other aids.

The nonsalaried office of cacique along with personal farming responsibilities have often led caciques to take up collections or acquire funds in some other way to travel and represent the tribe. Some caciques have found the sale of intoxicants as a way of obtaining the much needed cash to operate on. Where the cacique has not been able to keep financially ahead of the local self-appointed committeemen, he has largely lost his function, and it is doubtful that the institution will be reinstated in such places as League 15. The complexity of modern life has literally exhausted its capacity.

The case of Cacique General Martinez at Pampa del Indio is in a class by itself. This individual claims to have been appointed by President Peron in 1946 and is accepted as cacique general in those areas where he has been influential in establishing churches and continues to maintain a close control of those churches personally or through his lieutenant, Juan Fernandez. However Martinez came by his title, it merits the undisputed respect of several thousand Tobas across the northern area.

Increased nationalization in Argentina has brought the workers as a whole into a more solid group consciousness. This has also affected the Toba, many of whom now belong to the farmers' syndicate and attend its functions. In most respects the Toba have recently been embraced into the national setup more than the indigenous peoples of Mexico or the U.S. In general the functions of the institution of headman or cacique are rapidly shrinking. It is not so much that a need is no longer felt, but that the need is being more overtly met by direct government intervention. On government reducciones where a government administrator is in charge, caciqueship is a forgotten office. Outside government reducciones the status of the cacique depends on his ability to represent his people, even though this may be somewhat of a sham.

Caciques are more aware than anyone of how the coming of the church served to correct many social problems and consequently lifted from their shoulders the pressure of annoying law officers and angry criollo neighbors. The result has been in almost every case that the cacique has identified himself with the church. The fact is, he so welcomed the church in most places that he had it built hard on his own family dwelling. This has created numerous problems for missionaries where cacique behavior has not always been in accord with missionary views of the growth of the church and has tended to violate reformation attitudes concerning the separation of church and state. Further discussion on this subject is considered in Chapter VIII.

How long the institution of caciqueship will endure will be determined mainly by government policies toward the Indian. If the government supplies administrative personnel to replace the cacique, the change could be effected fairly easily and would, I am sure, be welcomed by most Tobas. On the other hand, if the government attempts to dissolve the institution without substituting anything in its place, the result will not be a happy one in most areas. There is still considerable prestige value accorded to the institution and this is especially true where the cacique is performing some kind of "legalizing" function and is closely associated with the directing of the church.

One of the most obvious difficulties that one encounters in attempting to discuss a culture is the apparent necessity of classifying its various aspects and dealing with these in separate sections of a report. The fact of culture is that these compartmentalizations are unrealistic and exist (even as culture itself) only as abstracts. It is not possible to deal with the subject of health and sickness without at the same time treating of the relatedness of these concepts to religion, economy, social organization, individual psychology, etc. Since the purpose of this report is to endeavor to interpret only some of the aspects of Toba culture, we will restrict the discussion to a rather narrow consideration of just these subjects.

It has been pointed out earlier that Toba culture is presently poverty-stricken in ceremonialism. This statement takes on meaning only in the light of the historical place occupied by ceremonialism among the Toba. Practically all ritual of the Toba consisted of chanting, singing and dancing, aimed at curbing some malevolent power or manipulating supernatural powers for the direct benefit of men. Many of these rites were associated with war, movements of the heavenly bodies, girls' puberty rites, hunting, fishing, collecting wild foods, but more than anything else curation of the body. Dancing was common as a form of recreation and often lasted until dawn. Usually only the young single men who were of marriageable age participated in the dance. Dancing of this kind served not only a spiritual role but also as recreation and a form of sexual stimulation. Young girls would often choose their paramours from the dance group and join in the dance by placing their hands on the shoulders of the young man of their choice for the evening's sexual encounter.

The central figure in most ritual practices was the cantador or shaman, who was a man who undertook a spirit quest in an individualistic manner. Spirit contact was sought for in the dense Chaco wood growths called monte. Here in absolute solitude the seeker encountered the spirit which advised him of the

kind of ritual to employ and the kinds of sickness in which he would be a specialist. This spirit quest was often accompanied by lengthy fasts and other deprivations which also served to let the people of the band know that a new individual was entering the profession. It was common for a novice cantador to return to the band thin and emaciated and covered with filth. The entire quest was shrouded in mystery and often upon return a demonstration of spirit possession was given by the shaman throwing himself to the ground after a frenzied stomp dance, uttering unintelligible vocal noises. Such a demonstration would serve to convince the onlookers that the quest had been a success and that new and additional supernatural control had been achieved for the local band.

The institution of shamanism continues today and the manner of spirit quest is essentially the same as in earlier times. Shamans today, as in earlier times, are called upon for two main functions: (1) the curing of the sick, and (2) paid revenge. Sickness is treated by sucking on the body in various places to determine the locus of the malignity. Accompanied with sucking is a constant blowing as the shaman works over the patient's body. The main part of the ritual, however, is the singing or chanting of unintelligible sounds. These chants are the mysterious language given the shaman by his co-operating spirit. They are acknowledged by the people as genuinely spiritual and therefore incomprehensible to the noninitiated. Likewise the chants of different shamans are mutually unintelligible. Since the coming of Christianity the Bible has been given place in some of the curation rites. Often Bibles are opened and placed around the patient as a power step-up in the generation of an effective curation rite. The shaman's evidence of a successful operation are the visible objects which are claimed to have been extracted from the patient's body. Payment, usually of a horse, is made upon recovery.

This procedure, while appearing as inefficient and non-scientific, is both efficient and scientific in terms of the logic which proceeds from Toba propositional truth concerning the etiology of disease. In the Toba way of reckoning, diseases are not caused

by microscopic organisms but by living organisms which are human. That is, all sickness is caused by intrusion in which another person is directly to blame. The only way the source of the sickness may be removed is to withdraw the intruded objects. Toba curations often possess an emotional value in themselves which we victims of scientific medicine don't receive. That is the psychotherapeutic value of such cures. In many cases a Toba patient is surrounded by family and friends who are actively participating in the curation by dancing, drum beating and singing. The patient is made conscious of the fact that all those who are dear to him are sparing no effort to restore him to normal health and participation in the group. These ceremonies may last for days. Those who live more closely within the folds of the church have dispensed with the shaman and now pray fervently for the sick, and the repetitious singing of hymns (usually without much bodily movements) is an integral part of the Christian ritual. These prayer meetings may last for a day and a night. More common are those that run from dark until approximately midnight.

Although curation practices between believers and nonbelievers are somewhat different, they share much in common in the external expression of the act of healing. The fact is, the etiology of disease (a matter based entirely on factual knowledge) remains for the most part the same for Christians as well as non-Christians. This matter will be discussed more at length in Chapter VIII, which deals with questions and answers.

The second main function of present-day shamans is to carry out personal revengeful acts. This consists mainly in bringing about the death of a person or persons for acts committed against the offended party. It is not clear just what ritual is practiced in this connection but it appears that the cantador requires some personal object of the victim such as his spittle, some hair, etc., to work this spirit-controlled revenge. Killing of people via a spirit-dominated revenge motive is practiced not only by professional shamans but appears to be carried on by certain old women as well. This practice would appear to be in contradiction to the statements given in Chapter III which depict extremely smooth-

operating interpersonal relations within the local band. It will be recalled that it was remarked there that stresses and tensions do shine through the psycho-sociological warp and woof of Toba life. However, these interpersonal conflicts carry on their warfare within a very spiritual world which is largely clouded out to the outside observer. Until the writer entered into the area of highly personal matters with a few of the Tobas at League 15, this sphere of Toba life lay quite beyond the developing picture of Toba culture.

It may be safely said that the manipulation of spirits for whatever end still plays a dominant role in Toba interpersonal relations. It should also be noted that the decline of ceremonialism has swept away with it every aspect of the Toba's spiritual relationship to nature, but these relationships between individuals which give rise to sickness and revenge have been vigorously maintained. The loss of the first appear to be associated more with the general economic transition, while the latter continue to be fortified and supported within the still existing socio-psychological framework.

Concepts surrounding death among the Toba logically follow on what has been indicated above. Death is normally the end product of the kinds of spirit manipulation stated in the foregoing paragraphs. Since death does not come in a "normal" manner there is a certain amount of fear and despair which accompanies it. However, this fear complex is not associated with any kind of ceremonialism to prepare the soul of the departed for another worldly existence nor for a return to this one.

It is of considerable concern to the Toba that the spirits of the dead do not travel off to a distant land and remain there. The spirits of the deceased are held by the Toba to be ever present and to create numerous problems for the living. Much of the earlier ceremonialism such as gourd rattling, chanting, and dancing was aimed at driving these importunate ghostly intruders from the band. Taboo on saying the names of the dead continues quite strongly today, as well as the burning or burying of the clothing of the dead.

In a time when Toba dwellings were constructed of boughs and brush, these were burned on the occasion of death. Often an entire settlement would burn its dwellings if the death was considered to be a threat to the collective security of the band. This practice is not observed now, but it must be pointed out that it has not been due entirely to the coming of Christianity, but has been largely influenced by a transition to a more sedentary way of life, the momentum of which has thrown off or relaxed many former concepts. The relation of these concepts to Toba Christianity will be discussed in the following chapter.

VI. TOBA CHRISTIANITY

This section of the report is considerably more difficult than the preceding ones for three reasons. (1) It aims primarily at a discussion of the Toba church and its response to God as another aspect of Toba culture. (2) The nature of such a discussion in any Christian terminology sooner or later transcends the field of culture as such. The writer is aware of some of the conflicting issues involved, but is not competent to treat them from a many sided theological approach. (3) The several backgrounds of those missionaries to whom this report is addressed will determine in part the relative validity of this discussion, and they will act upon it guided by criteria which are the property of each individual. Since these difficulties must be faced throughout, the writer wishes at the outset to emphasize that this discussion must be looked at in the light of the writer's approach to both Christianity and society. For I am sure that an observer coming to the problem with different presuppositions concerning God, man, and culture would present a different, if not as valid, a picture. This does not mean that anyone's word is as good as that of anyone else. Such a concept logically leads to anarchy and the breakdown of a search for truth. It does mean, however, that the picture presented by different observers must be judged in the light of the assumptions they bring with them to the problem. I believe that my own position was made explicit over the course of months in the many discussions held at Nam Cum. It is in the light of that position that I trust those to whom this report is addressed will interpret it.

It has been suggested that present Christianity broke upon the Tobas and inundated them rather than making a slow and steady penetration. It has likewise been pointed out that the Jesuits found themselves frustrated by their inability to implant Christianity on the Toba and later saw their efforts largely carried off by their own cultural impediment, the horse. The present large scale action of Protestant Christianity that engulfed the Toba came at a time when the Toba will to elaborate and defend its own way of life had been shattered by a long series of complex historical

developments which wrought multiple changes in the Toba life setting.

It is calculated that intensification of Toba cultural patterns began to let up as early as the middle of the 19th century, and that at least eighty years of cultural disintegration stand between aboriginal Toba institutions and the institution of Christianity in its present form. The dominating process in this interim has been adjustment to a changing economy and desire for acceptance by criollo society. Ceremonial organization sloughed off to the barest minimum, while a modified form of social organization remained intact and has helped maintain the Toba language to the present time, although Spanish has now become the second language of the majority of the men.

Conspicuously absent among the Toba are the Catholic institutions associated with that church. The compadrazco, observation of fiesta days, baptism of infants, church weddings and burials, the mass and the Catholic Church itself are largely unknown to the vast majority of Tobas. Present-day Tobas look upon the Catholic Church as a city religion "that never showed any interest in rural people." The comparative isolation of the Chaco, the hostility of both the Chaco and its aboriginal inhabitants, left its mark on the entire atmosphere that exists there today. There are other factors which have facilitated the Toba entrance into Christianity. A comparatively large number of Protestant churches are found scattered throughout northern Argentina. The criollo population, while referring to itself as Catholic, is largely isolated from the institutions of the Catholic Church and presents an extremely liberal attitude toward its Protestant Toba neighbors. Also it must not be overlooked that the Toba caciques have been supporting the Gospel practically since its introduction. In short, the atmosphere has been extremely favorable considering the fact that the Tobas are a minority people in a Catholic country.

We come now to the discussion of the form of Christianity that occurs among the Toba. In a word, it is international Pentecostalism. The past fifteen or twenty years have seen a

phenomenal spread of this expression of Christianity in Argentina, Chile, and Brazil. Its growth has outstripped anything dreamed of by Protestants in Latin America. For the most part it has embraced the poorer classes of people and has divided, split, fused, and fragmented; and with each division it has been self-developing, facing its problems without the inhibitions of preconceived missionary methods and ideals. While it is not an ideal movement to many, the overwhelming fact remains that it is "movement" and has proclaimed the Gospel in a prodigious fashion. The international Pentecostal movement is dominated by no ecclesiastical authority laying its plans in a systematic step-by-step procedure. It is characterized by a strong emphasis on Gospel preaching, and the visible manifestations of the Holy Spirit. These manifestations are not everywhere the same, a common point of dissension among these churches. It is largely unconcerned with the relation of Christianity to culture. It places a strong emphasis on healing the sick by prayer and anointing with oil. It likewise uses whatever musical mediums are available as an integral part of its worship services. Such is the form of Christianity that came to the Toba. It did not come by Pentecostal missionaries going out and living with the Tobas and learning their language. Rather the Tobas went to it in the cities along the Parana river. They heard the Gospel preached and experienced the Pentecostal cultus. Those who heard began to preach among their own people. The result: Pentecostalism soon sounded a new key for the lives of several thousand Toba Indians.

It is specifically at this point that the inevitable question arises: Why did the Toba largely spurn the philanthropic and religious endeavor from the Jesuits to the Mennonites and receive Pentecostalism with open arms? To assume that the writer could give a complete answer to this question would be extremely pretentious. However, in the face of the danger of oversimplification I submit the following facts that must be taken into consideration in attempting any kind of an answer to this question. It will be recalled from Chapter IV that certain phases of Toba culture have tenaciously persisted in spite of deep-seated changes that have taken place in the acculturative process. These are individual spirit quests, a strong concern for the healing of the

body in a spiritual manner, chanting, and, to a lesser extent, dancing as an integral part of ritualism. Now, it is not enough merely to say that Pentecostalism found a ready-made house to move into. For had these concepts been under intensification and cultural elaboration in an organized and functioning system, it is doubtful that Pentecostalism or any other system would have been admitted other than as certain borrowed elements might come across. The important fact in this connection is that the last threads of an unraveling system were not only not being intensified, but were steadily losing meaning and leaving a people with nothing to give meaning to a way of life. It is this partial emptiness that came to be filled and surged Toba life with new and revitalized meaning. But what about the forms? The answer is that the forms were already there. They received new life and in turn gave life itself a new meaning. It is in terms of this conceptualization that I have urged you to accept Toba Christianity and to work with them as brethren in the church. This is also why I have repeated many times that Pentecostalism answered questions that the Tobas had to put to themselves, questions that would be largely meaningless to the missionaries.

There is an alternate interpretation which might be given here. "Revivalism" in the sense of a return to an older way of life is quite common among maladjusted societies which are undergoing severe change. There may have been "revivalism" among the Tobas at some earlier period, but there is no evidence to show that the forms of healing and church worship are urged upon the people as a return to the "good old days." All of the present forms of expression are sanctioned by appeal to Scriptural references, and many church members are against an excess of exaggerated bodily movements in the cultus. People are urged to seek the Holy Spirit. This is an intelligible dictum to any Toba, although it may sound quite strange to their criollo neighbors. Manifestations or proof of having received the Spirit is likewise no new concept to the Toba. While speaking in tongues is desirable, something on the order of shaman quest demonstration is quite convincing to most Tobas. It is practically impossible to exaggerate the importance of singing in Toba Christianity. Hymns are sung in Spanish, and every verse is soon known

by memory, by even the small children who hear them sung about the fires at night. In short, the Pentecostal form of Christianity stepped into a crisis situation and gave new meaning to old forms. The problem is not so much one of syncretism in this case, but reevaluation and reorientation. It must not be thought that bringing new meaning to old forms is the entire story. The ethical content of the Gospel has made an impact and has greatly facilitated the adjustments that a transitional life has required of the Toba. The impingement of the Gospel upon the Toba must be looked at in the light of substituted or added authority which came with the church and especially with the Bible. The Bible, being a written document, found its primary acceptance in the area of the Toba's concern for "visible legality." Here in the Bible was an official document that was the source of authority in the churches visited by the Toba in the cities. It was the final court of appeal for the few missionaries who occasionally visited the Toba settlements. It is this concern for justifying life in an acquired legal-paper sense that the Toba grasped for the Bible. The Bible was soon to find itself replacing charms, healing paraphernalia, and many other Toba odd assortments. This does not mean that the Bible was not read. It merely means that the Toba as a whole received the Bible into a value system that was hard pressed for achieving a new legal acceptance ideal. This is not difficult to understand in view of the circumstances which accompanied the rise of the modern cacique who was hopelessly wading about in a swamp of bureaucratic red tape and legal demands.

The acceptance of the Bible, then, meant a new authority. It is equally significant in terms of Toba leadership and authority values that the Bible was a highly impersonal authority. It was not another human who wished to coerce or force. Hence, the Tobas looked to the Scriptures as the great panacea for their social ills. Here at last was an acceptable authority filling a deeply felt need for legal recognition and making statements that had to be made if the Tobas were to advance under difficult conditions to their avowed goal, criollo identification.

The early content of preaching was a series of prohibitions directed toward acculturation conflicts. For many this still is the meaning of the Bible. These preached prohibitions were directly in line with the complaints law officers and criollos had been voicing for years. However, the Tobas were not beaten down so far as to accept such human action as authoritative. The Bible, on the other hand, was claimed to speak very kind words, palabras lindas, which were acceptable to the Toba. These prohibitions included stealing, lying, drinking and failure to undertake agriculture seriously. In short, through the newly acquired Biblical authority were projected all of those ideal norms which the Toba could not attain to without some extra-Toba benevolent nonpersonal authority. In a sense the Bible filled the role of a myth, and this myth greatly aided the Toba to move as a society to a more favorable position in which the content of the Gospel has begun to be felt. It must be borne in mind that this discussion is centered about the process of cultural change and the Bible at the incipient period shortly after 1935. It is in the light of this background that the missionary must view the role of the Bible as well as the modern cacique who found it only natural to align himself with this new authority that accomplished what he as a Toba leader could not do.

Ecclesiastical organization among the Toba is the only real intersettlement organization that exists. Cacique General Pedro Martinez at Pampa del Indio has in the past eight years been very active in urging the inhabitants of each settlement to build churches. Much of Martinez' direction has in turn been controlled by the Iglesia de Dios, Pentecostal group of Argentina with headquarters in Buenos Aires. This group stepped into the Toba picture long after the initial work had been accomplished. Their main contribution has been to give each church a legalizing permit and to help organize the local church leadership. This leadership is responsible for the conduct of the service in a particular locality. Recent attitudes expressed by the Toba indicate that the twenty-two or more churches under Cacique Martinez are dissatisfied with the neglect shown by their foster parent organization. This neglect in turn stems from the fact that the visiting pastor of the Iglesia de Dios is not satisfied with the moral behavior of some

of the Indian brethren and therefore refuses to co-operate with them. Beneath Cacique Martinez is Juan Fernandez of Pampa del Indio, who may be considered the Indian bishop of the twenty-two churches of the Chaco. There are churches outside this group, such as those at League 15 and League 17 and on the government reservation, but the twenty-two associated with the Cacique General form the bulk of Toba churches. While relations between Martinez and the Iglesia de Dios may not be harmonious, Bishop Juan Fernandez and some of his aids are still making pilgrimages to the Indian Mecca, the Iglesia de Dios Church in Buenos Aires. Although so far these churches have functioned without the need of salaried leaders, some of the present ayudantes are living in the expectation of regular salaries from this organization.

In spite of the fact that an outside group has attempted to set up some leadership in these Toba churches, the most conspicuous thing about them (aside from the accepted cacique) is their lack of overt leadership. In some churches, however, a local pastor who has a more forceful personality appears as a leader. It is also the case that local church leaders may tend to supplant the cacique where the cacique has let his responsibilities drift.

The main body of beliefs of the Toba churches is that of most Pentecostal churches. This includes mainly the emphasis on the acquisition of the Holy Spirit and healing. There are local accretions such as hard singing to drive the devil from one's head and other such ideas, but these are not generally shared throughout. Most believers carry a card stating that they are faithful Christians. These cards carry an expiration date and must be renewed. Some cards are stamped and certified with three different stamps of the Cacique General.

Some Tobas have stated their preference for a Pentecostal style of worship service because they like to sing hard and loud and all pray together. It is frequently stated by the Indians that in this kind of unison prayer those who are backward or don't know how to pray well can pray in their own fashion and not be embarrassed.

One of the striking factors of the Toba churches is the lack of Christian education. This is reflected in the age groups that attend. There has been nothing offered in the way of Christian education for children, and, as a result, when boys reach the age of ten or twelve and are granted freedom by their parents they cease attending church. It is mainly for this reason that the age groups in a Toba church include children up to about ten, then jump to men and women approximately 30 and contain approximately an equal distribution of middle-aged and elderly people. This gap between the ages of 10 and 30 applies primarily to males, since they achieve more parental independence than do females. The absence of these young males reflects the fact that for the fifteen years in which the churches have been active, young boys have been dropping out, and if they return, they do so usually after marriage. These young men often congregate outside the church to stare in at the fair sex. In a sense the church stands at a crucial point in its development. This young men's age group has received nothing from the church, and the oldest of these boys who have grown up on the outside of the church are now to decide if they want to re-enter as adults. This group will determine the future growth of the Toba church, and it does not look favorable. In these formative years during which they have received nothing from the church, they have formed a closer adjustment to the criollos in dances, ball games, and wine drinking at the boliches than have the older churchgoing Tobas.

The Tobas are well aware of the lack of Christian education in their churches and are casting about for help. In fact, they are so conscious of the need of training at this time that they will accept it from almost anyone who approaches them. Scripture translation and assisting the Tobas to plan their Christian educational programs will go a long way to help meet these emergencies. The next ten years will determine in a large part how effective the Toba church will have been in its comparatively short life.

VII. CULTURAL INTEGRATION

The purpose of this chapter is to summarize the major existing features of present-day Toba cultural institutions, and to show something of the relatedness obtaining among them.

Present-day Toba cultural roots go back to a seminomadic people who became a highly mobile equestrian tribe divided into numerous composite bands consisting of a number of extended family groups. Economic activity was built into a noncompetitive, collective socio-economic organization. The diet consisted almost entirely of flesh, both animal and fish; however, some wild vegetables were gathered and perhaps small quantities of garden produce were available. The hunting and fishing routine along with the constant migration was accompanied by a quite distinctive division of labor between the sexes. The loss of game and the penetration of the Chaco by the army and colonists set up severe stresses in the socio-economic structure of Toba life. One hundred fifty years of transition have not seen the Toba make a successful change over to agriculture.

The acceptance of a money-based economy, with the necessity of a radical change in diet and socio-economic activities, was accompanied by a loss of cultural integration and intensification. The major motivation for the past two generations has been the desire to accept the criollo way of life and to be recognized as a criollo people. Those values which are deeply rooted in the structure of Toba social organization have been most resistant to change. These are the institution of cacique, concern for group security expressed in healing ritual, the institution of shamanism with its accompaniments, the sharing complex, the supernatural arrangement of interpersonal conflicts, and the Toba language. To these are now added the Toba church which in a sense restores a semblance of ceremonialism.

Toba social structure has held itself intact wherever economic considerations from outside the Toba sphere have been tolerable. Even in many adverse cases the Toba extended families have

clung to each other in the face of devastating intrusions. There is a growing tendency for male criollos to marry with Toba women. In some cases the Toba woman leaves her family group to join that of her spouse. However, it is more characteristic for the criollo husband to enter the Toba family group. There is a desire expressed by Toba young men to marry criollo women, but so far they have not been sufficiently accepted by the criollos. However, at the rate of general criollo increase in the Toba areas and the general trend of criollization of young Tobas, it is likely that this kind of union will steadily increase.

The institution of cacique has been highly functional throughout all the transitional process, and has now shifted its main operations to the only ceremonial aspect of Toba life, the church.

The whole of Toba life is still essentially spiritually oriented. It was before the coming of Christianity, but has now largely re-oriented its activities and brought a lapsing ceremonialism into an amalgamation with the Pentecostal form of worship.

In the light of all that has preceded, we may ask how these various aspects of Toba life are linked together or integrated. It has been pointed out in a number of places that disintegration has been active, but there is little as yet to show to what extent integration is achieved. The most outstanding result of an ethnohistorical study of Toba integration and disintegration is the way in which the various elements, traits, and institutions of its culture have changed their relationship to each other. Below is given a chart which shows the five aspects of Toba life presented in this report. Beneath the row of five culture traits are given the numbers from the culture traits which are most closely linked and integrated.

	1	2	3	4	5
	Economic	Social Organization	Shamanism	Political	Church
	2	1	2	1	
1500	4	3		2	
		4			

		1	2	2	
1935	2	3			
		4			
		1	2	1	2
1954	2	3		2	4
	4	4		5	
		5			

Integration here refers to the nature and extent of the reinforcing relationships that hold between any two or more of the traits. Of course, it is not true that shamanism was unrelated to economic activity in 1500 nor at the two later periods. Any Toba knows what the economic implications are when he hires the professional services of these specialists. What I have attempted to do is to compile the number and kinds of elements that each possesses and to consider no relation a reinforcing one unless it was consistent with the general cultural orientation at the historical period indicated. Since the details behind this chart are not relevant to the people addressed in this report, only a brief summary will be given.

The block for 1500 indicates that economic activity was highly integrated with social organization and also with the institution of cacique. Social organization remained in close linkage with economic activity, shamanism and caciqueship in all three periods. Shamanism has remained vitally dependent upon social organization in all three historical periods. Caciqueship, while related closely to economics and social organization in the precontact period, lost its relationship to economic activity in the second period, and with the rise of the modern cacique shortly after 1935 was again reinforcing not only the socio-economic aspects of Toba life, but along with social organization stepped into the newly created category of the church. It will also be noted that economic activity has been integrated with social organization at each period and with caciqueship, except in the 1935 period, and the two traits which reinforced economic activity were extended to support the church. However, the church and economic activity have not found any mutual relationship. While this is merely

a skeletal outline of the integration and relationship between the aspects of Toba culture presented in this report, the information in the preceding sections should serve to fill in the picture for those who are living and working among the Toba.

VIII. QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS

I propose to set forth in this final chapter a series of questions and answers which represent an attempt to state the relevancy of this study to Toba culture, Toba Christianity, and mission endeavor. Before presenting the questions that arise from a study of this kind, I should like to give a brief answer to the primary question: What is the purpose and aim of a culturological investigation of this type and how can it be validated? Clearly, the purpose is knowledge, to know. And its aim is to give direction and purpose to that knowledge. I wish to make it unequivocally clear that I reject the idea that any anthropological, sociological, psychological, or any other methodological compilation of data can be aimed directly at man's personal relationship with God. Such an idea would be a horrible distortion of what is the task of the church and what are its tools. This knowledge, faulty as it is, is a rightful tool of the church, which has gone unused and undeveloped for the most part. This lack of development has resulted mainly from the failure of Evangelicalism to grasp the implications of human culture and personality. The mass missionary movement since the 18th century has been carried out largely with the tacit assumptions of a Christian cultural heritage, coupled with an emphasis upon the necessity of personal spiritual conversion, without considering the social and cultural implications of this conversion either in so-called Christian societies or in so-called non-Christian societies.

While it is true that the church remains divided between the Evangelical emphasis on the individual and his lonely choice and the Catholic emphasis on the corporate order, both have carried on as though culture could be largely discounted. If the international missionary movement has taught us anything, it has been the dire necessity of the church to move to a more responsible position as regards man in the natural order.

It is commonly stated that much of the wide-scale embarrassment resulting from mission endeavor in Asia, Africa, and the

Americas stems directly from a failure to take into account local cultural settings. I do not believe this to be an adequate accounting of the facts; nor is it possible to consider this problem aside from a historical view of Christianity and culture. Although I do not propose to discuss this matter in detail here, I believe certain things need to be said.

The earliest Christians were a small minority who never dreamed that their faith would spread and engulf empires, or that it would become elaborated into a theological system and serve as a basis for the religious domination of Western society for a thousand years in the Dark Ages. However, the fact is, that Christianity, in its various forms, spread and found itself involved in every assortment of conflict, from the economic and religious Crusades, to the Second World War in which Mr. Winston Churchill uttered the famous statement, "The Battle of Britain is about to begin. Upon this battle depends the survival of Christian Civilization." Such a declaration stands a world apart from the thought of those humble believers of the first century who looked for their immediate departure from this earth and therefore paid little or no attention to this world's setting.

The concept of a Christian civilization is entirely questionable. Looking at the problem from the point of view of the Christian faith, Emil Brunner writes:

"Anyone who approaches the New Testament with the intention of getting instruction about the relation between Christian faith or doctrine and civilization or culture from the most authoritative source, cannot fail to be astonished, bewildered and even disappointed. Neither the Gospels nor the letters of the apostles, neither the teaching of Jesus himself, nor that of his disciples, seem to encourage us in any way to investigate this relation. . . This Gospel is concerned with man's relation to God in its innermost mystery and with the relation to man in the most personal and intimate sense, without any reference to cultural values and social institutions."

in the most personal and intimate sense, without any reference to cultural values and social institutions."1

Even the few side remarks we find in the New Testament concerning social problems are rather negative. For example, slaves are encouraged to be satisfied with their lot. Christians everywhere today disavow slavery in any form as being incompatible with Christian conceptions of justice and freedom.

Historical attitudes which have distracted from the central message of the Bible have been responsible, in a large way, for creating an atmosphere whereby modern man can no longer hear the message of God as witnessed to in the Bible. There is little wonder that such historical movements as the Renaissance and later the Enlightenment attempted to tear loose from a way of thinking which assumed that world truths (those truths that man must discover by scientific method) were contained in Holy Scripture and there was no need to seek about in nature for anything further. This failure to distinguish between the relative knowledge of this world's truths and the message of the Bible that pointed to eternal truth carried on as part of every good believer's "Christian culture." It is essentially this confusion that has contributed to a position of cultural superiority among great numbers of modern missionaries. To make the matter even more complex and regretful, this attitude came to be interwoven with assumptions of Western progress that have grown out of the technological revolution of the past 100 years. The result has been disastrous in many respects and has witnessed the diffusion of concepts of cultural progress based on technology coupled with a medieval conceptualization of the relation of the Bible to culture. This manner of thought is chiefly responsible for precluding the spontaneous growth of Christianity in primitive culture.

1 Emil Brunner: Christianity and Civilization, Charles Scribner's Sons, New York, 1948, pp. 6, 7. Used by permission.

All of this points to one thing, that the church cannot afford to exist in ignorance of the dynamics of what constitutes the human setting. The assumptions which each age brings with it to the hearing of the Gospel must necessarily determine a relevant communication for that age. Such a communication must be vastly different between the spiritually oriented Toba and the value-indifferent Euro-American. The assumptions the Tobas make about their own human worth stand at an opposite pole from modern man's ideas of himself. Responsible evangelization can never accept the idea that whatever happens in the human setting cannot dull man's perception of spiritual truth. The sad commentary of our own national history points directly to the opposite.

Responsible Christianity is the overall expression of the church. Responsible evangelization is the task of the church and makes use of these tools that provide knowledge of the human setting. It is becoming commonplace for younger missionaries to expose themselves to cultural anthropology as a help in their work. I sense that in this movement there is a tendency to compartmentalize this knowledge and think of it only in terms of primitive societies. For responsible Christianity this is unfortunate and is a misunderstanding which is inherited directly from the historical divisions between sociology and anthropology. The latter is often referred to as the "science of leftovers." In this conceptualization of responsible Christianity there is no sociology-anthropology dichotomy. Christian anthropologists, a small body to be sure, have a live and actual responsibility to their endowing culture even though they may be engaged in the life and analysis of a foreign cultural system. Responsible Christianity knows no difference in kind between the simple and the complex society, and it is because of this that sociology and anthropology merge into one. The name to be applied is not of great moment.

In short, such a brief study as the present one is carried out as part of the overall character of responsible Christianity, and it is done so to acquire knowledge. This knowledge is not an end in itself. While this knowledge multiplies and leads to more

accurate knowledge, it ever remains within the limited sphere of human reason. It operates mainly in the area of responsible evangelization to explain the nature of those human forces that equip each individual Christian and non-Christian with the many assumptions with which he faces life (and therefore the Gospel). It seeks to keep before the church and society an evaluation of cultural movement and calls attention to those many interacting cultural and societal dynamics which will set up barriers to effective responsible evangelization. Insofar as this knowledge is used to this end it is validated.

The questions and answers that follow attempt to relate this knowledge to three areas of activity: A. Toba Christianity, B. Toba Culture, and C. Missionary Endeavor. It is hardly necessary to say that the nature of this knowledge is transitory. That is, it is not to be thought of as the absolute truth. The fact is, it may be the case that some of the data given here have already been superseded by a better accounting of the facts. Hence, this warning tends to throw an atmosphere of temporality into the entire work, and this is as it should be, for to think that what is given here is the final authoritative word on the subject would be to discredit the whole purpose of the work. Cultural systems, by their nature, are in constant flux. Different cultural patterns are moving within their own internal adjustments as well as to contact adjustments at varying speeds. Hence, an intelligent approach to this study is one which accepts the responsibility to continue the attitude of keeping abreast of the entire problem. Ten years from now many of the things said here may be quite antiquated. Such is the dynamic natural order in which human life revolves.

A. Toba Christianity.

1. How is the church among the Toba validated?

By its missionary endeavor entirely. This is what validates Pentecostalism everywhere. It is pointless to seek any other criterion. This is not primarily extra-Toba mission endeavor;

however, this activity is beginning in several areas. So far, Toba evangelical responsibility has for the most part been restricted to the Toba. In this connection it must be pointed out that evangelization has been integrally linked with the structure of social organization and not with any ecclesiastical structure. The latter could hardly be called a structure at all. The witness has moved mainly within the extended family framework, and out of these kin groups have come believers. This is consistent with the nature of interpersonal relations among the Toba.

2. How is the church among the Toba related to Toba culture?

The majority of Toba churches operate by temporary agreement under the Iglesia de Dios with headquarters in Buenos Aires. However, this organization had nothing to do with the evangelizing of the Toba, and the failure of this group to visit and attend to the Tobas' wishes has practically severed the agreement. Also, this organization does not accept what it calls lack of discipline among some of the Toba preachers. This group of churches which numbers approximately twenty-two is under the immediate supervision of Cacique General Pedro Martinez. This politico-religious leader appears to be accepted as such in the twenty-two areas. Juan Fernandez is the pastor of the main church at Pampa del Indio and is responsible to Martinez. Each of the twenty-two churches has a dirigente appointed by Martinez and several ayudantes. Some of the better organized churches boast of deacons and a treasurer. The principal function of the dirigente is to lead the service, while the ayudantes are the musical directors. That is, they lead out in the singing of hymns. Hence it is clear that the institution of caciqueship has assumed a leading role in the direction of the church.

It was pointed out in chapters IV and VI that the Gospel and the founding of the churches went a long way to provide a corrective in a seriously maladjusted socio-economic situation. Consequently, pressure from authorities was eased and the caciques were in the lead aligning themselves with the churches. This leadership has had considerable influence in creating a favorable atmosphere for evangelization. (The Toba story is not entirely

unlike the history of the Slavic Orthodox churches that moved into Christianity as communities under the leadership of their princes.) As would be expected from the date given in the preceding chapters, Christianity has not set up a rift between believers and non-believers. Individuals have come from many family groups but have not attempted to set up a church community against their natural community. There is little, if any, derision or ridicule. The Toba way grants an individual considerable freedom for his personal acts. There is no ceremonially organized system for a Toba to break from in his new identification with the church. Practically the only conflict that exists is in the realm of the manipulation of poderes or spiritual powers. Even here the Toba believers feel no need of breaking away. They are quite satisfied that God's Spirit is far greater than any local powers. In quite a real sense the majority of Toba churches are interfamilial social groupings in which the people recognize a consanguineal or affinal relationship. It is in this capacity that the church organization has stepped in to reunite the separating extended families and to hold the basic social organization intact. Before the coming of the church these family groups were slipping into isolation, due to the loss of ceremonialisms which fell off under the acculturation movement.

The Toba emphasis on curation of the body through shamanistic and spiritual media did not cease with the advent of Pentecostal Christianity. It reoriented itself for those who entered the church. But it must be pointed out that most Tobas do not accept this re-orientation as an either /or proposition. To the believers shamanism is not God's way, but they testify from their own experiences that people are often made well through the good offices of the shaman. Hence, the shaman is looked upon as we may think of a medical doctor. And I would caution missionaries to assume the same kindly attitude, for the Toba attitude is determined by his kind of knowledge concerning the etiology of disease. He certainly will not acquire a different kind of knowledge from reading the Bible. The believers' prayer for the sick is still aimed at getting rid of the thing that is inside the body and causing the illness, even though there be no extractions by suction to prove that the thing has been removed.

Unless we have clearly in mind the basic assumptions which we carry around as our prime movers and the assumptions the Toba brings with him (in all of life), we will never have the satisfaction of understanding why he does the way he does. Nor will we be able to lay bridges across the yawning cultural gaps that separate us. At the interpersonal level the Toba believers may be characterized as spiritually concerned for their relatives and friends. Again this is nothing new within Toba life. Interpersonal concerns have always been handled in a spiritual manner. See Chapter V on conflicts. This attitude and practice has had an extremely high transformation value in Toba Christianity. Toba culture has prepared believers to pray for their unbelieving kin. There is no outward show of concern for their salvation nor is there any emotion displayed over the fact that one has become a believer. Independently, Tobas do not make the missionary's common believer-nonbeliever distinction in conversation. Their concern is not framed in any kind of setting that suggests aggression against those nonbelievers. For a missionary to harp on any such idea means aggressive behavior to the Toba and is therefore quite unacceptable. These values find their way into the content of preaching. The love of Christ is emphasized, and any tendency to single out the behavior of some individual or group is met with silent strong disapproval.

It may be safely said that the church is quite unrelated to Toba economic activity, except to say that Tobas would rather be in church singing than picking cotton. The leveling tendency of the socio-economic life of the Toba makes most Tobas feel quite unsuccessful when they compare themselves with missionary and criollo economic status. This unrewarding activity of farming is little to be desired, while sitting about in pleasant conversation or singing away the day and most of the night satisfies the Toba desire to be at peace within himself in a genuine corporate, yet spiritual, activity.

While this discussion could continue into great detail, I wish to add only that Christianity has come into Toba culture but that responsible Christianity must never rest as a welcomed guest. It must continually throw up questions to that culture and demand

a reconsideration of its entire stock-in-trade. This begins the cultural reply to responsible Christianity and must continue as long as the two exist in an ever interacting relation.

3. What is the future of the church among the Toba?

The answer is that it is unpredictable. However, I believe there are some facts that might indicate the development of future events. In Chapter VII it was pointed out that two cultural institutions presently reinforce the church, caciqueship and social organization. The present government policies may replace the caciques and the church will undoubtedly be affected. The church is weakest among the Toba where native leadership has been replaced and social organization has been most affected, viz., the government reduccion Napalpi near Quitilipi. Since the current orientation of the Toba is aimed at identity with the criollo population, the church should aim at spreading to the criollo groups. As identification becomes more complete in a nonchurch direction, the church will become less meaningful. Therefore, the Toba should become aware of this fact and aim to direct the movement of the church in the criollo direction where life will find its future setting. In short, a missionary work among the Toba which does not attempt to keep abreast of this drift may find itself without a Toba church and beginning from scratch with the new criollo order. The zeal to accomplish the job exists among the Toba today. This may not be so ten years from now.

It was pointed out earlier that the church becomes spiritually meaningless to young people at the approximate age of puberty. This has always been the period when young men became quite independent of their parents. Puberty-age girls are likewise granted considerable freedom but tend to remain in groups near their female siblings, mothers and aunts. The motivation for the presence of these boys around the outside of the church is primarily sexual. There, staring through the holes in the mud and wattle, these youth are given the best opportunity of the week to inspect as in a showcase the girls of their choice. The Tobas' lack of Christian education which will offer these young people a

Toba Christian approach to life has nipped in the bud what could (but may yet) be a flowering growth. Coupled with this fact is the commonly expressed desire of adults to get their children educated so that they can go to the cities and work. Many older people feel that the church has been a lifesaver for them, and it has in many respects, but they do not see the church as a heritage to pass on to their children. It has been mainly the church's "fill-in" role that has clouded out its real and eternal value for many Tobas. It is no doubt true that the correctives provided by the church which have eased the acculturation conflicts have caused some to miss the church's real values. And it has been the adults over 20 years of age that have passed through the pre-church and church period. The appreciation of the Gospel expressed continually in worship services is a historical expression which every Toba adult feels deeply, but is quite meaningless to the younger set. The failure to achieve an effective communication for the younger Tobas may actually witness a breakdown in the church which will never be reparable. In this connection it should also be borne in mind that these young people are the ones who are achieving the highest degree of criollo identification. In short, the future of the Toba church is at stake, and the next few years will determine much of its course.

4. What is the role of healing in the growth of the church?

In answering this question we must not think that our own historical settings have seen the exhaustion of the operations of the Holy Spirit. I do not think it at all incredible that the Spirit of God can and does work quite to our provincial amazement in ways we do not expect or feel to be entirely in accord with our Scriptural interpretations. Health has always been a prime concern among the Toba. In fact, it may not be exaggerated to say that concern for health of the body runs to almost pathological extremes. Healings which are effected in the group prayers and singing of the believers have been responsible, to a great extent, for the rapid growth of the church. The witnesses to the fact of healing by the prayers of the believers have turned large numbers to the church. Consequently, former practices are given up. I wish to call to mind here that there is much confusion in

evangelical thinking about "giving up heathen practices." Modern missionaries are engaged very often in Quixotesque attacks on windmills. They succeed in shattering the outward form of some pagan practices without coming to terms with the ideas and motivations that support those practices. Hence, the case often is that the old motivation, much to the missionary's surprise, raises its head later right in the midst of the church. Practices are given up for a number of reasons. The most common is that they lose their meaning, grow old and just die. Also common is the loss of practices which are no longer being reinforced by older concepts, and hence, they are gradually or quickly lost, depending upon other factors. In acculturation situations, and especially where "wealthy white missionaries" become something of an economic goal for a changing-value people to aim at, practices which are inconsistent with the missionary's private views are often ditched. Here the motivation for the loss of practices stems directly from a zeal to receive recognition from the missionary. Such motivations, however pleasing to the native, cannot develop responsible Christianity. This situation also contributes to the common "relapses into paganism" when the missionary leaves.

The pre-Christian healing exhibited much of the same materials as the present Christian healing. These are the extreme concern for health of the body, and singing and dancing as a power medium. We may ask: How has this complex become re-oriented rather than lost? In the first place, the coming of the church (not missionaries) did not, nor need it, suggest that it is wrong to be healthy. It looked to God instead of the shamans as the source of health and healing. This reorientation served to replace the shaman, or to place him in a very secondary role. Those accompaniments of the church such as the Bible became the substituted paraphernalia. Singing and chanting became the singing of Christian hymns. The idea which gives singing its place in the ritual was not lost. They sing a new song which calls upon the Great Physician. There may be room yet for an occasional bit of jumping. I merely add that a bit of Toba jumping to the glory of God may be a sweeter incense to God than a lot of our modern theological gymnastics we indulge in ourselves.

5. What is the role of the Bible?

In spite of the fact that comprehension of the Spanish words in the Bible is extremely low, among the better readers sufficient meaning has been grasped to communicate certain essentials of the witness. I am personally of the conviction that the function of the Word of God in its widest meaning is visibly demonstrated among the Tobas. From the outset the Bible has played a very broad role indeed. It has replaced earlier paraphernalia which were used in curative rites, such as the wearing of a bundle of charms on the back. The Bible often finds itself in this position now. It is laid out around a sick patient and opened to certain passages. It may even be called into play when a shaman is at work, especially if he considers his patient a believer. A shaman may attempt to read from the Bible (perhaps upside down) during a cure. The old knit bags that were used to carry such odd ends as fishing tackle and charms have now been emptied out and almost everyone has a New Testament in the bag. I do not claim for a moment that this is, in numerous cases, more than a substitution of one charm for another. The point I do hasten to make is that the new "Bible charm" comes with a new order. I would encourage every bag to carry the new charm, for while it may be merely a charm today, it is part of the creation of a new atmosphere. The job of responsible Toba Christianity is to exploit the atmosphere that has been given to them and bring about a genuine reorientation to the Bible charm. The road from the Bible charm to responsible Christianity is much shorter than the road from the old charms to responsible Christianity.

The vast majority of the Tobas have no direct communication with the Scriptures. It remains to be seen whether the Toba Scriptures will lay a foundation for Christian education and a less emotional expression of Christianity.

6. What is the role of the sacraments?

Baptism and the Lord's Supper have various meanings among the Tobas just as they have in our modern churches. Baptism is

often related to healing. As we might expect, this teaching is not of Toba origin but is preached at the Toba Mecca in the Villanera Church in Buenos Aires. In those Toba churches connected with that group, the Lord's Supper is given about once a year if those responsible get around to it. The Toba believers are highly indignant that the Lord's Supper should be withheld from them and are beginning to celebrate it themselves in house meetings. I do not believe there is as much magic connected with it as there is in the average North American church.

7. To what extent is there an awareness of sin?

The Toba believers are very much aware of the fact that all is not right between a sinner and God. However, there is a strong tendency to set down smoking, drinking, dancing and stealing as outstanding sins. These "primary" sins tend to cloud out some other areas of activity that the Tobas have not come to feel as being detrimental to the growth of the church. Those "obvious" sins mentioned above are things which have resulted in the conflicts of acculturation and therefore occur as most striking to the Toba.

8. What is the criollo reaction to the church?

It has been stated earlier that there are a number of Protestant churches in the Chaco and that the presence of these is very favorable to the existence of the Toba church, especially since quite a few of these churches are Pentecostal. The mass development of a trait that is not criollo among the Tobas may call for some explanation. The church has come largely from the city, a higher prestige level than local criollo life. Most connections with the Toba churches have stemmed from the city. The extra-Toba seat of authority for the churches is in the capital at the present. Hence, while the church does not fit into the immediate picture of acculturation to local criollo life, in a sense it seeks its identification within the realm of greater social and political recognition, the city and the capital. The mass of the criollo population is quite indifferent to the Toba church, a condition which arises mainly from their geographically severed connection with the Catholic Church. Some criollos

naturally feel that the Toba churches represent an amalgamation of aboriginal customs and evangelical Christianity. Oddly enough, most of those practices pointed out by the criollo as being pagan are behaviorisms the Tobas have learned from the Pentecostals. Or, as the case may be, the Tobas have read of certain things in the Bible and have endeavored to put them into practice, e.g., greeting the brethren with a kiss is often done between males in a long protracted kiss on the lips. Such practices strike the criollos as quite disgusting. Also the emotional form of Pentecostalism is objected to as "exaggerated." The emphasis on singing in groups about their fires at night likewise appears to the criollos as nothing but a continuation of older times that are familiar to most adult criollos. In spite of the disapproval of the outward manifestation or expression of Toba worship behavior, most criollos are agreed that the Toba churches are a good thing, for, as they will often remark, "Since the Tobas got their religion they have ceased cutting our fences and stealing our cattle. They have begun to work for a living."

B. Toba Culture.

1. Can the Tobas become successful cotton farmers and compete with their criollo neighbors?

As has been implied, the socio-psychological structure of Toba life is oriented away from private ownership, individual wealth, and competition. These values are making inroads into the Toba system, but one has to search hard to find them. Individualism in Toba life is directed more to spiritual than to material ends. Material ends are wished for (more than labored for) to satisfy corporate ends that will not violate the aims of the present classless society. This system is closely integrated into the nature of Toba social organization which reinforces it throughout. As long as the Tobas are allowed to remain in their present settings, i.e., as long as no Inca or Russian type population reshuffles take place, the trend will continue to be gradual assimilation into the criollo way, with the accompanying breakdown of the remaining social structure. It is within this framework that the church must look to the future. Mission failures

to produce hard-working, competition-ridden Tobas should not be reason in itself to abandon small-scale technical assistance programs. Such programs should, however, be based upon a thorough-going knowledge of what constitutes the nature of Toba life, not just what Tobas say to missionaries or what missionaries independently think is the best thing for the Toba. It would be desirable from almost every Toba's point of view to have the material equivalent of the better class criollos. However, it is wiser to admit that the poor are poor because of a complex set of circumstances. If these circumstances can be partially understood, they must be taken into consideration in any program aimed at changing living conditions. It must not be thought that money has exactly the same meaning to a criollo and a Toba. It is true that money soon became a necessary means for survival when the dietary transition was accomplished, but whereas money is saved and invested by the criollo to satisfy his competitive drive, it is not so with the Toba. The Toba's money serves to satiate his desire for short-term prestige which he knows will soon be leveled out within his extended family groups.

2. What is the future of the Toba language?

The subject of the Toba language has been excluded from this report since it has been dealt with in An Outline Toba Grammar, Nam Cum, Argentina. However, I believe it may be valid to make an attempt to answer this question which is bound to face anyone working in a highly acculturated language and culture situation. In passing, it may also be interesting to observe that the very acculturated Tobas exhibit extremely little acculturation in their language, while the only slightly acculturated Quechua exhibit an enormous linguistic acculturation to Spanish. One must be careful to make the distinction between the process of acculturation in culture and language.

Without going into detail as to how I have treated this question, I will give what I consider some figures related to the question.

Assume that there are 15,000 Tobas living as of November 1954. Assume that 3,150 of these are males between the ages of 11 and 75 years of age. The approximate following age breakdown would occur.

<u>Years</u>	<u>Percentage of total male population</u>	
11-45	75	75
46-60	20	20
61-75	5	5

All monolingual Toba men will disappear approximately between 1965-70. Spanish has been acquired by 75 per cent of the present bilingual men with the following contacts: boliche, towns, criollo neighbors. These contacts have steadily increased so that the age group 15-30 has had these additional Spanish contacts: farmers' syndicate, military service, increased criollo contact mainly through intermarriage, the church, missionaries, and a few schools. Both the early and late contacts have taken place with an accelerated drift into criollo life.

The following factors, while not predictable, will determine in a large part the direction and rate of Toba language loss.

a. Government intervention such as government schools, refusing to allow Toba literacy and Scriptures, suppression of caciques, church, etc.

b. Increased Toba-criollo marriage. So far the trend is for criollo men to choose Toba women. If these women leave the Toba family, their children learn only Spanish. If Toba men begin marrying criollo women, Toba will lose out fast.

By 1970, 100 per cent of the Toba males in the age brackets given will be accepted as bilingual by Toba and criollo criteria. Likewise 25 per cent of the Toba women will be bilingual. If the present assimilation and acculturation trends continue to mount at the rate they have risen over the past 30 years, I calculate that Spanish will become a first language for most Toba children

by 1990. However, the rate of increase in assimilation and Toba language loss will continue to rise sharply with the expanding criollo population, the development of national industry, the growth of cities, such that the date 1990 may be pushed ahead 10 years or more.

C. Missionary Endeavor.

1. From an acculturation point of view, how are the missionaries related to culture change among the Tobas?

It has been stressed throughout that the dominating trend of Toba culture is readjustment. This readjustment or adjustment to surroundings has been greatly intensified for those Indians who live in a face-to-face association with outsiders. This kind of association is more marked in a mission setting than in a government reduccion. This condition results primarily from the fact that in the former the individuals involved are fewer in number and have more direct access to the white leaders. Also, the custom of all individuals calling each other "brother" tends to break down many of the barriers that exist in nonmission environments. The common church with Indians sharing the preaching duties, as well as the many other informal interpersonal relations between missionary and Toba, serve to create an atmosphere which is highly conducive to rapid adjustment to the way of life which is aimed at by both Indian and missionary.

Now, it seldom occurs to a missionary that his practice of living his "normal" routine of life constitutes an overt attempt to strive for a certain way of life. And this is a way of life that must be desirable because it represents the striving of the leaders of prestige, both in material as well as spiritual culture. That this really is so can be seen from the following. Children and adults appear constantly in a variety of dress. Seldom are these clothes old, tattered or unkept. A large amount of time goes into washing, sewing, and ironing. Food supply is a major undertaking requiring automobile trips to the city to provide the necessary food and other materials. Tanks of fuel are sought after to

keep the lights bright and the washing machines popping. Children's toys and adults' gadgets, from cameras to automobiles, require a vast amount of time in using them out and then fixing them up. Eating alone is a tremendous achievement and requires one room of a house loaded from the floor to the ceiling with things to prepare a meal that is spread out on a table as long as a man's body. A house to live in requires a separate bed for nearly every member, with more chairs to sit on than there are people to sit. To indulge in reading and relaxation books, magazines, pamphlets, pictures and records weighing as much as a team of oxen are required. To perform the daily ablutions of the inner man another room with pipes, pumps, enamel and mirrors is essential. And to keep in touch with the outside world a city post-office box, the weekly paper, and a battery radio are demanded. I hasten to add that this is not sarcasm or criticism. I am merely reminding us that what constitutes our "normal" living routine requires a great deal of human time and energy, and that human beings don't normally indulge in activities for long unless those activities are in some way rewarding. It is this tremendous continued human effort to maintain a way of life that proves that our accepted daily routines are rewarding and a way of life to strive for.

Now, if the Toba ridiculed such bustling activity as foolish and spurned it as a poorly devised way of life, the missionary would be very fortunate, for he could knock himself out just living as the complicated heir of 20th century technocracy. He would be able to squeeze in his preaching hours and that alone would the noble and independent Toba learn. However, the Toba, like almost everyone that is looking outside of his life for social and cultural recognition, is so made as to learn his lessons from the whole of his environment where the great academic compartmentalizations of life and knowledge have not yet penetrated. Whereas the missionary is proud of the achievement of his grandfather who opened up the West and laid the first railroad to help earn our modern form of life, the Toba now looks back on his grandfather with pity and even scorn. Many a Toba has said to me, "The old folks were wild and didn't know how to wear these clothes and eat this kind of food." These words reflect a trend of thought

which can only occur within an adjustment orientation. Even present-day old people, such as old man Naporiche, are drifting aimlessly about in a cold and unfriendly world. One frequently hears such statements: "These old men only know about the old way of life; they are not criolloized like we are."

It is not necessary to say that mission endeavor is not responsible for this situation. It has come about as a great transition resulting from culture contact, and I would not be so romantic and unrealistic as to say that this should never have taken place. Such is the nature of human history. I am only attempting to point out that the missionary fits into a cultural setting, and in that setting he is determined by a complex set of circumstances to play a certain role. However, the question is, how can he play it down in order that the learning process of the Toba doesn't overshoot the message and strike the missionary's cultural status and impedimenta? The obvious answer is to level the impedimenta and reduce the status to one that will not distract from the missionary's central purpose.

The plan at Nam Cum was to prepare the Indian believers to be missionaries to their own people. This was, and is still, an excellent idea. However, in this case the Toba mission Indians learned more than they were supposed to. They learned through intimate contact the criteria for a "missionary." The inability of these potential native missionaries to operate on a par with the white prestige-charged missionary resulted in a Toba expressed emotional upheaval. They refused to do anything, and the most offended member was the one who was acknowledged by the missionaries as the most learned. This young man, who spent part of his most formative years in the mission environment, finally exhibited signs of manic depression. This entire situation could have been avoided by careful planning and being aware of the motivations and drives which underlay the Toba behavior in a mission situation. The acquisition of material goods (see sample inventory in Chapter II) in the light of the dominating trends of Toba culture would have been sufficient to make the missionary suspicious. These Indians have now been reallocated to their former all-Toba environment where they will undergo an

extreme readjustment to life, but if they are able to find a satisfying place in the settlement among their relatives and can accept the Pentecostal piety, they will no doubt make a reasonable readjustment. If they feel too estranged in their new environment, they may continue to suffer severe conflicts.

2. In view of the foregoing, should the missionary try to live like the Toba?

There is no yes-or-no answer. The Toba looks forward to attaining criollo status. The content of one's preaching and teaching would not be nearly so apt to be sidetracked if it were not associated with the present cultural complex. If a missionary among the Tobas could maintain a level of life that is within the aspirations of the Toba, say for example, a setup equivalent to that of Domingo Arguello, communication between Toba and missionary would be greatly improved. I hasten to stress that "going native" is not a universal ideal and that every local situation must find its own definition of an effective communication. It would be obviously foolish for a missionary in Buenos Aires to dress like a criollo and live in a criollo house. His rapport with people of Buenos Aires would drop to less than nothing. The total situation in Buenos Aires or Chicago can have little or no influence in determining a rapport status in Nam Cum where a missionary seeks a communication level that is compatible with Toba norms and ideals. It may well be that the Tobas would prefer that their missionary live in a white man's house and not ride a horse. However, the Tobas look upon the Nam Cum missionaries as "brothers," not as princes. While they will imitate you as an ideal in many aspects of your life, they most deeply want your fellowship and this on a reasonable par. At least this is the response one gathers while living with the Indians at League 15.

How one is going to live also depends upon where one will live in relation to the Indians. If the missionary is going to live at a distance and visit the Indians in their settlements then the living conditions are not so important. However, for maintaining a face-to-face living arrangement the simple criollo life would be the rewarding one. Concerning that much emotionally discussed

subject, how far can you go in identification as defined in the local situation, I do not care to discuss all that has been said at Nam Cum, especially in our final meeting. But I should like to add that there is no selfless approach to that problem unless a missionary has come to the conviction expressed by Dietrich Bonhoeffer, "When Christ calls a man he calls him to come and die." I can say no more.

3. What can be said about missionary preaching in the Toba churches?

This is an area that needs to be carefully considered by the missionaries. There are numerous Tobas who are not in the church, and hence, a vast area of evangelization is to be done, but I believe this should be done in close co-operation with the existing patterns of evangelization that have been discussed briefly. This is not submission to a local expedient, but is a method that has proven its worth. However, it should be kept in mind that the missionary is something of a brother-at-large in that he belongs to no kinship group and should have more or less the same kind of access to all. I believe it is generally agreed by now in Nam Cum what kind of preaching is most relevant. However, I should like to add that our preaching may be entirely apostolic in essence and yet appear as something quite different to the Toba. This situation is due not only to theological backgrounds but also to day-to-day thinking which is done largely within the framework of our world view. This was true for the elaborations of the apostolic preaching also. It is very possible that this world view determines in a large part how we approach the preaching, the kerygma. Consequently, while we are addressing very pertinent questions to ourselves, these may often be quite irrelevant and misleading to the Toba conception of the problem. At any rate, there is great need for clear foundational teaching which will present these truths in terms of propositions that the Tobas are daily making. That Christ is foreshadowed by the mouths of the prophets is perhaps quite unrelated to and unconvincing to Jose X who saw Pablo Z get healed while the believers prayed and sang all night. My personal feeling on this matter is that the largest job of the missionary is to find out how

best to establish effective communication with the Toba churches in order to present a Gospel that will build toward responsible Christianity.

4. What do the Tobas desire in a missionary?

There are societies that tend to close themselves up to outsiders (Ecuadoran Quechua), while there are others that appear to reach out and embrace the outsider. I should certainly say that Toba society represents the latter type. Speaking from the Toba male point of view I list the following desiderata:

(1) They wish to be given an opportunity to share their experiences with a missionary, not as a hit-and-run visitor, but as one who will find his way into the quiet atmosphere of their spiritually oriented lives.

(2) They feel best when there are few separating mechanisms between themselves and the missionary.

(3) They prefer to speak in Toba.

(4) They desire help from the missionary which is aimed at improving their capacity to effectively witness to the criollos to whom they often look up.

(5) They like to feel that a missionary is "suffering" with them in their behalf. (To enter a Toba rancho with a horse in hand is worth two cars parked in the bush!)

(6) They trust and follow strong leadership as fervently as they dislike weak and vacillating leadership.

5. In view of the present structure of Toba Christianity and the church, what is the missionaries' role?

One of the first impressions one has after visiting among the Tobas is that a missionary is superfluous. However, I believe that there are several factors that need to be taken into consideration. Toba society may presently be described as extremely

dependent. This dependency stems from the avowed desire of the Toba to be helped to achieve criollo identification. This dependency attitude is seen also in the church. It may be that the present forms of Toba piety are becoming unsatisfactory to the Tobas themselves. Certainly there is unanimous concern among the Tobas for Bible teaching. Their awareness of their present inadequacy in Bible training causes them to throw themselves upon anyone who will approach them with the Bible.

The past as well as the present structure of the church has gone a long way to preclude a second generation growth of the church. This is extremely interesting in view of the fact that most missionary setups look forward to the second generation Christians as the real beginning of growth and maturity in young churches. Very often in these latter cases what is really taking place is that an accepted or missionary piety is more easily taken on by the youth in their early enculturative experience since there is a much less apperceptive mass with which to receive the new way of life. The Toba church came into being like a whirlwind and blew the second generation potential right out of the church. To date it remains out, due to a failure of the Toba to achieve responsible Christianity.

As has been mentioned, the Tobas' awareness of their inadequacy to witness effectively to the criollos is related to their lack of Biblical comprehension. This does not mean that they have no witness. The Word of God is not so restricted. Hence, there appear to be four categories in addition to evangelization that appear to me as being in need of missionary co-operation with the Toba churches.

1. Toba leadership training.
2. Christian education in the church.
3. Bible translation.
4. Encouragement of responsible Christianity.

Toba leadership training is not a simple task, and I think it is agreed by all that it should not be done outside of a Toba environment where much of the communication is lost, or ambushed

by cross cultural forces that are operating. There is also a serious problem created when the mission attempts to single out "promising" individuals to become leaders or exercise leadership. These individuals do not want to be looked upon as imposing their personality on the group; hence they will tend to avoid roles that are apt to force them upon the group will. Of course, there are bound to be exceptions. Consequently, a leadership training program will most likely have to include a whole church or be open to all and be done within the framework of the church, and not as something aside from the corporate body of the church. A general kind of corporate preparation will be good for all concerned, and the accepted leadership by Toba conceptions of it will not be such a decisive factor if the entire body has been spiritually led ahead. A poor leader will serve better in a spiritually awakened church body than a single outstanding leader in a dead and indifferent church. This kind of corporate leadership training calls for going to the people at those times of the year when activities permit and staying long enough to accomplish a task.

The matter of Christian education should be worked out with the church and should be aimed at making the church meaningful to all age grades. If this is not done I fear that the Toba church is going to have a loud but short life.

Bible translation has been sufficiently discussed at Nam Cum and need not be repeated here.

Close fellowship with the church and nonbelievers alike should enable missionaries to comprehend the difficulties confronting the church in the transitional life of the Toba, and help them to co-operate effectively with their Toba brethren in achieving responsible Christianity which looks forward to the continuation of the church rather than looks back later at its disappearance.

6. What is the role of medicine in the Toba work?

The question that one really must ask is something like this: If knowledge of the etiology of disease precludes genuine faith

and reliance on God for healing, then is this knowledge justifiable? I do not know how to answer this question. If we say no, we assume an attitude characteristic of much of the Dark Ages. If we say yes, we have exalted science where perhaps science of this kind would lead to the decay of the Toba church. I believe it is the relation of healing to the church that needs to be handled, rather than medicine as a problem in itself. The answer lies in the development of responsible Christianity which should aim at setting the conception of the church's foundation on Christ alone. This is not to say that the church is not properly conceived by the Toba, but there is a tendency to see only as far as the works themselves. If the church's orientation is Christward and He alone is its one foundation, knowledge should not disrupt it, provided, of course, that culture be required to answer and act on those valid questions that responsible Christianity addresses to it.

In concluding this report, I wish to hazard one further interpretation which should be seriously considered by any Christian, and especially by people who do missionary work. Concluding Christ's Sermon on the Mount, the seventh chapter of Matthew offers a collection of Christ's sayings, the most famous of course being the so-called Golden Rule, Matt. 7:12: "So whatever you wish that men would do to you, do so to them; for this is the law and the prophets." Upon this one axiom, we are told, hang the law and the prophets. But what is the meaning of this saying that is so all-inclusive? Here it would appear that Christ had in mind a relationship that involved people of the same family, kin group, village, or at the outside the same culture and society. For in the preceding verse it refers to a relationship obtaining between a parent and child and speaks of a cultural understanding of what is a "good gift." As interpersonal relationships move farther and farther apart culturally, i.e., from the most intimate parent-child relationship to a completely cross cultural relationship, does this verse lose its meaning? Only if we attempt to stretch the parent-child gift-giving meaning to a cross cultural situation does the meaning become distorted. Hence, we are forced to ask ourselves if the simple parent-child relationship has any bearing on the meaning of this verse at all. Fortunately for Christianity,

Christ rejected every form of legalism and left no code of moral directives, but rather an attitude which is meant to be applicable to all the vicissitudes and changing conditions that life presents.

Now, as a product of a certain cultural and social setting, I have many needs that I seek to satisfy in a variety of ways. The more complex my needs are the more complex are my ways of satisfying those needs. If I behave as it comes natural, i.e., without reflecting, since that requires effort, I shall wish that men attempt to satisfy my complex needs in a complex and ego-centered satisfying manner. For if A through X represents my needs, it will require that others perform A'...X' to satisfy these needs. Then these are the things that "you wish that men would do to do you." Now I am asked to do A'...X' to other men. This is a very happy situation of balanced reciprocity as long as both individuals have needs A...X. But the Christ that spoke these words is also the Christ who commissioned men to go forth to the uttermost parts of the earth where Mr. A...X meets up with Mr. A...F. Now, these two need-bearing individuals A...X and A...F, because of the fact that they are both human beings, share a certain number of common biological and psychic desires. Also, their cultural lives will no doubt overlap in many places so that we can say that there is always a common area of need. However, the local setting has a way of channeling these desires into such different paths that oftentimes they hardly recognize each other when their paths cross. To make the situation even more complicated, different settings concentrate on different needs, depending on goals and orientations, and elaborate some and simplify others. In the process, the human individual picks up a varied number of drives. Hence, when A...X meets A...F, the former may feel that he is putting into practice the Golden Rule by doing A'...X' to Mr. A...F. What results is a very complicated problem for modern communication engineers. We may greatly oversimplify it by merely saying that all of Mr. A...X's behavior from G' through X' is lost in the process or reinterpreted by A...F working overtime.

This all becomes very obvious when moved to less generalized categories. Whereas I may desire for myself a necktie for

Christmas, I would only be asking a half-naked Moro to find an interpretation for it if I give a necktie to this Moro Indian of the Paraguayan Chaco. If I desire to be paid in money for my services, I do not therefore assume that my Moro friend would desire to be paid in money, a thing he can have no use for. These cases may seem too trite to be related to the problem. Very well, consider the following. I wish that my Toba Christian brother punish my child with corporal punishment for having kicked by Toba friend; therefore, I will proceed to punish every unruly Toba child with a spanking even though this form of punishment is unchristian and unacceptable to any Toba. I wish men to be blunt and frank in business dealings with me; therefore, I will be this way with Ecuadoran shopkeepers and artisans even though such behavior is interpreted as a direct personal affront by them. I desire that some individuals in my economic system earn their living by making beds and tables because I need these items. Therefore, I will set up a bed and table industry among the Tobas even though these items find little need in that society.

Thus we could go on into every phase of life and find that our needs are not the needs of other men, and therefore, what I wish men to do to me often becomes meaningless if I do these things to other people. Now, I believe that nearly every person recognizes the truth of this, and therefore, does not really carry literalism to an extreme in this verse. If it were literally practiced, it would mean an absolute authoritarian exaltation of the ego. I would be given divine sanction to project my needs onto other men, and consequently, destroy the basic attitude which Christ has given us.

On the other hand, the argument presented thus far heads straight into the blind alley of the relativity of values. That is, it is a dead end for anthropology which claims to describe facts scientifically, and then turns around to step out of its skin and state an attitude toward life, then back into its skin it goes and claims to be describing the facts again. The facts can no longer be merely described, because they are provided with a meaningful scheme. Meaning is being striven for, and this meaning or interpretation is with a note of finality which its own philosophy rejects.

How then does the content of Christ's teaching avert any such goose chase of reasoning? In the first place, Christ addresses us here as disciples, not as ordinary men. Does this strengthen our authoritative position? No, it denies it to the fullest and makes Christ alone the center of our need. All other needs are seen in a new light. In comparison to our need in Christ they now stand like grains of sand beneath the shadows of the mighty pyramid. They lose their pivotal position in the ego-centered personality and take their position alongside the simple needs of primitive man. In a logical sense, life becomes primitive because the prime and basic factor occupies the center of all motivation. This to me is "discipleship," *Die Nachfolge Christi* of Bonhoeffer.

Now we approach afresh Christ's words about our relationship to other men. I now ask, what do I wish that men would do to me so that I will possess a criterion for my relationship to them? My need is in Christ and my life seeks to be an imitation of Him. I am called not to dine but to die. How then do I have needs that determine my conduct with other men? My Christ-centered motivation makes me need Christ, and in order to know how to behave toward any man, I need to put myself in that man's position and then be confronted by the supreme decision that Christ demands of every man. I find my old personal world quite irrelevant from this new man's position. I find the assumptions that he carries with him now wholly relevant to this world of his and understand how these affect his decision. The idea of imposing my will drops dead in its tracks. My cultural or personal superiority shrivels to insignificance, for I am being faced by the Christ of decision from another man's world. From this new position I see my true relationship to the man I have replaced. I can no longer judge or impose authority. The relativity of values transforms itself into the meaning of values, and a science of behavior reduces to an accumulation of data. Knowledge becomes alive and existential, and I am no longer a mere datum. This is the road to responsible Christianity that replaces the law and the prophets and bids farewell to self.

GLOSSARY OF SPANISH AND TOBA TERMS

- algarrobo--pod-bearing tree. The pods are ground and allowed to ferment in water, producing a kind of chicha beer.
- antiguos--old people.
- ayudante--helper.
- boliche--country store.
- bolichero--owner of a boliche.
- cacique--chief or headman.
- campo--open grazing country in the Chaco woodlands.
- cantador--lit. singer; name applied to healers because their ritual consists largely in singing.
- compadrazgo--godparent complex.
- colonos--settlers.
- cosechero--cotton picker.
- criollo--This term is used in the Chaco to designate the non-Indian and nonforeign settlers. In the area of this study many of the criollo people are Guarani-Spanish speakers, admittedly white, and have migrated into the Chaco from the Province of Corrientes. Also, many of them have migrated into Argentina from Paraguay.
- dirigentes--directors.
- kilo--2.2 pounds.
- la'--hello (Toba).
- mate--a native American plant whose leaves are used for making tea. Also called mate yerba. It is grown chiefly in Paraguay.
- monte--densely wooded portions of the Chaco.
- nal'en--good-by (Toba).
- obrajes--work camps in the monte where the quebracho colorado wood is cut and shipped to extraction mills.
- poderes--powers.
- quebracho colorado--a very hard reddish wood from which tannin is extracted. The tree gets its name from "queiebra hacha," axe breaker. In addition to hide curing, tannin is much in demand in oil drilling operations where it is used in obtaining a proper mud viscosity.